Fries, Face Wash, Forests: Scoring America's Top Brands on their Palm Oil Commitments

Supplemental Material 2: Detailed Scoring Breakdown

Packaged Food

CONAGRA

| | | Possible | | Notes |
|---|--|----------|-------|--|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | |
| Deforestation-Free | | 20 | 20 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to deforestation | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. | | + | "In addition, by December 2015, we will source palm oil only from suppliers whose landholdings and operations meet the following principles No development on high conservation value landscapes or high carbon stock (HCS) forests." ₁ |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 20 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to peatland destruction | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by committing to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | + | "In addition, by December 2015, we will source palm oil only from suppliers whose landholdings and operations meet the following principles No development on peat lands regardless of depth, and use of best management practices for existing plantations on peat." ₁ |
| | 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion. | | - | |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Traceability | | 20 | 20 | |
| Commitment to tracing palm oil | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified. | 15 | + | "In addition, by December, 2015, we will source palm oil only from suppliers whose landholdings and operations meet the following principles Traceability to the extraction mill and validation of fresh fruit bunches to the plantation estate." ₁ |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability. | | - | |
| Commitment to ask their suppliers about the GHG footprint of their production | Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.5 or 5.2 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies. | 5 | + | RSPO ACOP ₂ |

CONAGRA

| | | Possible | | |
|--|--|----------|-------|--|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Transparency | | 20 | 20 | |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. | 10 | + | RSPO member and submitted 2013-2014 ACOP ₂ |
| | 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. | | - | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan with intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | + | "2014 - 100% of total usage through Book & Claim. 2015 - 100% of total usage through a mix of Book & Claim and Mass Balance. 2020 - 100% of total usage from RSPO CSPO physical supply chains in our own branded products. To reinforce RSPO principles, we are working with our suppliers to support the development of a sustainable, cost-effective market for palm oil to prevent the |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | - | deforestation of lands for the purpose of developing new palm plantations. We will purchase palm oil only from RSPO members – with preference for purchasing RSPO certified sustainable palm oil. In addition, by December 2015, we will source palm oil only from suppliers whose landholdings and operations meet the following principles:• Only legal sources that adhere to all relevant international, national, and local legislation and regulation. • No |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | - | development on high conservation value landscapes or high carbon stock (HCS) forests. While the HCS methodology is being refined by field testing and science review, new plantings should only be established in low carbon stock areas. • No development on peat lands regardless of depth, and use of best management practices for existing plantations on peat." ₂ |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | 5 | + | "As part of our commitment, we have integrated responsible palm oil procurement guidelines into our sourcing strategies and have engaged our suppliers in review of their palm oil production and sourcing practices – and we will continue to do so. If an audit or other highly credible source reveals or confirms that a supplier is seriously violating the stated principles, and if that supplier does not acknowledge and immediately move to acceptably remediate the concern, we will move to suspend or eliminate palm oil purchases from the supplier in question." ₁ |

CONAGRA

| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Possible Points | Score | Notes |
|------------------|--|--------------------|-------|--|
| Current sourcing | | 20 | 4.1 | Numbers taken from ACOP |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | $= 20 * \text{Mean} \begin{pmatrix} \frac{0+0+.25 * (63448 + 5968)}{95645} \\ \frac{0+0+.5 * 775}{1665} \\ No \ POD \end{pmatrix}$ |
| Total | | 100 | 84.1 | |

References

1. Exhibit A Palm Oil Commitment: <u>http://www.osc.state.ny.us/press/releases/aug14/ConAgra_agreement.pdf</u>

2. 2013-2014 ACOP: http://www.rspo.org/file/acop2014/submissions/conagra-foods-inc-ACOP2014.pdf

Other Reviewed Materials

3. 2014 Citizenship Report: <u>http://media.corporate-ir.net/media_files/IROL/97/97518/ConAgra_2014_Citizenship_Report.pdf</u>

DANONE

| | | Possible | | Notes |
|---|--|----------|-------|--|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | |
| Deforestation-Free | | 20 | 20 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to deforestation | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. | | + | "Under this new policy, Danone has committed to sourcing traceable palm oil offering guarantees of zero deforestation and exploitation. Concretely, all palm oil used by Danone must: come from plantations whose expansion does not threaten High Conservation Value (HCV) forestscome from plantations |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | _ | whose expansion does not threaten High Carbon Stock (HCS) forests (*)" ₁ |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 20 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to peatland destruction | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by committing to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | + | "Under this new policy, Danone has committed to sourcing traceable palm oil offering guarantees of zero deforestation and exploitation. Concretely, all palm oil used by Danone must come from plantations whose expansion does not threaten any tropical peatland, of whatever depth" ₁ "Initially, Danone undertook to source 100% of its palm oil |
| | 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion. | | - | requirements from physically segregated sustainable palm oil suppliers certified by the Roundtable on Sustainable Palm Oil (RSPO)—at the time, the strictest standard in the industry. By the end of 2014 this commitment will be met." ₁ |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | by the end of 2014 this commitment will be met. 1 |
| Traceability | | 20 | 20 | |
| Commitment to tracing palm oil | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified. | 15 | + | "Under this new policy, Danone has committed to sourcing traceable palm oil offering guarantees of zero deforestation and exploitation. Concretely, all palm oil used by Danone mustbe traceable to the plantation where it was produced" ₁ |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability. | | - | |
| Commitment to ask their suppliers about the GHG footprint of their production | Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.5 or 5.2 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies. | 5 | + | RSPO ACOP ₂ |

DANONE

| | | Possible | | |
|--|--|----------|-------|--|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Transparency | | 20 | 20 | |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. | 10 | + | RSPO member and submitted 2013-2014 ACOP ₂ |
| | 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. | | - | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan with intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | + | "Danone new supply criteria will take effect immediately following the official announcement of this policy. Phase 1 (transparency and assessment) is scheduled for completion by the end of 2015. Phase 2 (transformation) will be introduced gradually as progress is made in Phase 1. Each year, Danone will publish a full and |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | - | transparent report detailing progress. No later than year-end 2015, based on results obtained in Phase 1, Danone will define a detailed timeline for reaching its goal of eliminating all deforestation impacts. This timeline may be accelerated from the initial goals set in Danone forest footprint policy as soon as possible and in any case before 2020." ₁ |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | - | |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | 5 | + | "These policies will seek to ensure traceability of all priority risk commodities [includes palm oil] for both direct and indirect sourcing, which will target 100% sustainable sourcing when standards exist and will be endorsed by independent and competent third-partiesWhen standards do not exist, Danone will engage with external stakeholders and be transparent on selection criteria and implementation guidelines to safeguard sustainable purchasing standards. Danone will regularly update the above lists, seeking relevant stakeholders inputs, to make sure that they cover future evolution in global deforestation hotspots. Progress on compliance versus our policies will be tracked, quantified and reported yearly in the Group Sustainable Development report starting 2014 as well as in the Forest Footprint Disclosure Project starting 2012." ₃ |

DANONE

| Criteria Current sourcing | Scoring Guidance | Possible Points 20 | Score 9.2 | Notes Numbers taken from ACOP |
|------------------------------|--|---------------------------------|---------------------|--|
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | $= 20 * \text{Mean} \begin{pmatrix} \frac{0 + .5 * 17300 + .25 * 7700}{25000} \\ \frac{0 + 0 + .5 * 500}{500} \\ No \text{ POD} \end{pmatrix}$ |
| Total | | 100 | 89.2 | 2 |

References

1. Palm Oil Policy: <u>http://www.danonewaters.com.cn/dev/static/download/Palm_Oil_Policy_Danone.pdf</u>

2. 2013-2014 ACOP: http://www.rspo.org/file/acop2014/submissions/danone-ACOP2014.pdf

3. Forest Footprint Policy: <u>http://www.danonewaters.com.cn/dev/static/download/danone_forest_footprint_policy_en.pdf</u>

Other Reviewed Materials

4. 2013 Sustainability Report: http://finance.danone.com/phoenix.zhtml?c=95168&p=irol-reportsannual

GENERAL MILLS

| | | Possible | | Notes |
|---|--|----------|-------|--|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | |
| Deforestation-Free | | 20 | 20 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to deforestation | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | + | "In addition we will source palm oil only from suppliers whose operations meet the following principlesNo development on high conservation value landscapes or high carbon stock (HCS) forests. While the HCS methodology is being refined by field testing and science review, new plantings should only be established in low carbon stock areas." ₁ |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 20 | |
| <i>Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to peatland destruction</i> | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by committing to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | + | "In addition we will source palm oil only from suppliers whose operations meet the following principlesNo development on peat lands regardless of depth, and use of best management practices for existing plantations on peat." ₁ |
| | 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion. | | - | |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Traceability | | 20 | 15 | |
| Commitment to tracing palm oil | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified. 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to the plantation is traced to the plantation is traced to the plantation is traced to the plantation is the plantation is the plantation is traced to the plantation is the plan | 15 | + | "In addition we will source palm oil only from suppliers whose operations meet the following principles Traceability to the extraction mill and validation of fresh fruit bunches." ₁ |
| Commitment to ask their suppliers about the GHG footprint of their production | traceability. Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.5 or 5.2 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies. | 5 | - | |

GENERAL MILLS

| | Possible | | |
|--|--|--|---|
| Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| | 20 | 20 | |
| Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. | 10 | + | RSPO member and submitted 2013-2014 ACOP ₃ |
| 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. | | - | |
| Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan with intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | + | "To help ensure our purchases do not contribute to deforestation of the world's rainforests or negatively impact the communities that depend on them, we will source 100 percent of our palm oil from responsible and sustainable sources by 2015 we will source palm oil only from suppliers whose operations meet the following principles: |
| 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | - | Only legal sources. No development on high conservation value landscapes or high carbon stock (HCS) forests. While the HCS methodology is being refined by field testing and science review, new plantings should only be established in low carbon stock areas. No development on peat lands regardless of depth, and |
| 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | - | use of best management practices for existing plantat on peat." ₁ "3.1 Date expected to/or started to use any RSPO certified par products - own brand: 2012. 3.2 Date expected to be using 10 RSPO certified palm oil products from any supply chain option own brand: 2015. 3.3 Date expected to be using 100% RSPO certified palm oil from physical supply chains (Identity Preserv Segregated and/or Mass Balance) - own brand products: 2015. |
| Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | | + | "As a principled purchaser, General Mills engages its suppliers in direct review of their palm oil production and sourcing practices – and will continue to do so. If an audit or other highly credible source reveals or confirms that a supplier is seriously violating the stated principles, and if that supplier does not acknowledge and immediately move to acceptably remediate the concern, General Mills will move to suspend or eliminate palm oil purchases from the supplier in question." ₁ |
| | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan with intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | Scoring GuidancePoints20Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP.105 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting.10Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan with intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015.53 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015.11 point: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015.11 point: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015.11 point: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015.11 point: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015.11 point: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil b | Scoring GuidancePointsScore202020Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP.+5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reportingFull 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan with intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015.+3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 20151 point: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 20151 point: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 20151 point: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 20151 point: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppl |

GENERAL MILLS

| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Possible Points | Score | Notes |
|------------------|--|--------------------|-------|---|
| Current sourcing | | 20 | 2.8 | Numbers taken from ACOP |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | $= 20 * Mean \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ \underline{0 + .5 * 25167 + .5 * 25389} \\ 61148 \end{pmatrix}$ * Note: GM reported only use of derivatives in ACOP. We verified that GM uses palm oil and palm kernel oil as well. As we were unable to assign volumes to palm oil or PKO, we took the mean of al three numbers assuming those two were zero, as was reported on the ACOP. |
| Total | | 100 | 77.8 | |

References

1. Statement on responsible palm oil sourcing: <u>http://www.generalmills.com/en/ChannelG/Issues/palm_oil_statement.aspx</u>

2. Policy on Climate: <u>http://www.generalmills.com/Home/ChannelG/Issues/climate_policy.aspx</u>

3. 2012-2014 ACOP: http://www.rspo.org/file/acop2014/submissions/general-mills-ACOP2014.pdf

Other Reviewed Materials

4. Making progress on our sourcing commitment: <u>http://www.blog.generalmills.com/2014/12/making-progress-on-our-sourcing-commitment/</u>

5. 2014 Global Responsibility Report: <u>http://www.generalmills.com/~/media/Files/CSR/2014_global_respon_report.ashx</u>

HEINZ

| | | Possible | | Notes |
|---|--|----------|-------|--|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | |
| Deforestation-Free | | 20 | 10 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to deforestation | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. | | - | <i>"3.3 Date expected to be using 100% RSPO certified palm oil from physical supply chains (Identity Preserved, Segregated and/or Mass Balance) - own brand products: 2023"</i> ₁ |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | + | |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 5 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to peatland destruction | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by committing to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | <i>"3.3 Date expected to be using 100% RSPO certified palm oil from physical supply chains (Identity Preserved, Segregated and/or Mass Balance) - own brand products: 2023"</i> ₁ |
| | 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion. | | - | |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | + | |
| Traceability | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to tracing palm oil | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified. | 15 | - | |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability. | | - | |
| Commitment to ask their suppliers about the GHG footprint of their production | Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.5 or 5.2 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies. | 5 | - | No on ACOP ₁ |

HEINZ

| | | Possible | | |
|--|--|----------|-------|--|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Transparency | | 20 | 18 | |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. | 10 | + | RSPO member and submitted 2013-2014 ACOP ₁ |
| | 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. | | - | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan with intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | - | "3.2 Date expected to be using 100% RSPO certified palm oil products from any supply chain option – own Brand: 2013 3.3 Date expected to be using 100% RSPO certified palm oil from physical supply chains (Identity Preserved, Segregated and/or Mass Balance) - own brand products: 2023" ₁ |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | + | |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | _ | |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | | + | "Heinz completed its conversion to 100% certified sustainable palm oil in December 2013. Our Global Sustainable Palm Oil Steering Team, which includes our key regional procurement, quality and R&D personnel, assesses and facilitates compliance with this goal globally." ₂ |

HEINZ

| | | Possible | | |
|------------------|--|----------|-------|---|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Current sourcing | | 20 | 9.9 | Numbers taken from ACOP |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | $= 20 * \text{Mean} \begin{pmatrix} \frac{0+.5*(407+4900)+.25*248}{5555} \\ \frac{0+.5*235+0}{235} \\ \frac{0+.5*91+.5*127}{218} \end{pmatrix}$ |
| Total | | 100 | 42.9 | |

References

1. 2013-2014 ACOP: <u>http://www.rspo.org/file/acop2014/submissions/hj-heinz-company-previously-known-as-h-j-heinz-company-ltd-ACOP2014.pdf</u>

2. Sustainable Sourcing: <u>http://www.heinz.com/sustainability/supplychain/sustainable-sourcing.aspx</u>

Other Reviewed Materials

3. Supplier Guiding Principles: <u>http://www.heinz.com/our-company/ethics-and-compliance/supplier-guiding-principles.aspx</u>

KELLOGG CO.

| | | Possible | | Notes |
|---|---|--|-------|--|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | |
| Deforestation-Free | | 20 | 20 | D |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to deforestation | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. | | + | "Protect forests: - No development of High Carbon Stock forests and High Conservation Value areas" ₁ |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 20 | D |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to peatland destruction | mitment to Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm "Pro ce palm oil that oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and - not contribute to if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that + land destruction + - | "Protect peat lands No new development on peat areas regardless of depth Apply Best Management Practices for existing plantations on peat"₁ | | |
| | 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion. | | - | |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Traceability | | 20 | 20 | D |
| Commitment to tracing palm oil | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified. | 15 | + | "Requiring our suppliers to trace palm oil to plantations that are independently verified as legally compliant, meet the above principles for protecting forest, peat lands, and human and community rights, and comply |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability. | | - | with all RSPO principles and criteria" ₁ |
| Commitment to ask their suppliers about the GHG footprint of their production | Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.5 or 5.2 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies. | 5 | + | "Asking our suppliers to demonstrate a progressive reduction in the GHG emissions of the plantations that they source from and report on the GHG emissions of the operations." $_1$ |

KELLOGG CO.

| | | Possible | | |
|--|--|----------|-------|---|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Transparency | | 20 | 20 | |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. | 10 | + | "We are working to achieve the above commitments in the following ways Reporting annual progress for achieving the above commitment against which we publicly report In 2014, all the palm oil we use is sourced through a combination of RSPO Certified Segregated supply (7%), Mass Balance supply (66%), or covered by the purchase of GreenPalm certificates." ₁ RSPO member ₄ |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan with intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | + | <i>"In 2012, we began being using a combination of RSPO Certified Segregated and Mass Balance supplies of palm oil for Europe and continued our commitment to cover 100 percent of the remaining palm oil used globally with the purchase of GreenPalm certificates. In 2014, we were</i> |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | - | able to begin using RSPO Mass Balance for palm oil used in the U.S. and continued our commitment to cover 100 percent of the remaining palm oil used globally with the purchase of GreenPalm certificates" ₁ "To achieve its goals, Kellogg will require all global palm oil suppliers to trace palm oil to plantations that are independently verified as legally compliant; adherent to |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | - | the company's principles for protecting forests, peat lands, and communities; and compliant with all Roundtable on Sustainable Palm Oil (RSPO) principles and criteria. Suppliers must comply with the requirement by Dec. 31, 2015, or be working to close any gaps identified in their action plans." ₃ |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | | + | "We are working to achieve the above commitments in the following ways Requiring our suppliers to trace palm oil to plantations that are independently verified as legally compliant, meet the above principles for protecting forest, peat lands, and human and community rights, and comply with all RSPO principles and criteria" ₁ |
| | | 5 | | |

KELLOGG CO.

| Criteria Current sourcing | Scoring Guidance | Possible Points 20 | Score 8.5 | Notes Assumed all GreenPalm is CPO and all physically sourced is PKO |
|------------------------------|--|--------------------------|-----------|---|
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | $= 20 * \text{Mean} \begin{pmatrix} \frac{0+.5*0+.25*100}{100} \\ \frac{.5*100}{100} \\ No POD \end{pmatrix}$ *Based on the following language: "In 2014, all the palm oil we use is sourced through a combination of RSPO Certified Segregated supply (7%), Mass Balance supply (66%), or covered by the purchase of GreenPalm certificates." ₁ - Assumed use both CPO and PKO based on 2011-2012 ACOP ₂ |
| Total | | 100 | 88.5 | |

References

1. Palm Oil Commitment: http://newsroom.kelloggcompany.com/download/Kellogg+Company+Palm+Oil+Commitment.pdf

2. 2011-2012 ACOP: http://www.rspo.org/sites/default/files/ACOP2012_CGM_4-0033-08-000-00-97.pdf

3. Kellogg Announces Global Commitment To Fully Traceable Sourcing of Palm Oil: <u>http://newsroom.kelloggcompany.com/2014-02-14-Kellogg-Announces-Global-Commitment-To-Fully-Traceable-Sourcing-Of-Palm-Oil</u>

4. RSPO member page: <u>http://www.rspo.org/members/249/Kellogg-Company</u>

Other Reviewed Materials

5. Climate Policy: http://www.kelloggcompany.com/content/dam/kelloggcompanyus/corporate_responsibility/pdf/2014/Climate_Policy.pdf

KRAFT FOODS

| | | Possible | | Notes |
|--|---|-----------|-------|-------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | |
| | | 20 | 0 | |
| Deforestation-Free Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to deforestation | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. | | | |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | _ | |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to peatland destruction | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by committing to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland | | - | |
| | protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion. | | - | |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Traceability | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to tracing palm oil | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified. | 15 | - | |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability. | | - | |
| Commitment to ask their suppliers about the GHG footprint of their production | Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.5 or 5.2 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies. | 5 | - | |

KRAFT FOODS

| | | D | | |
|--|--|-----------|-------|---|
| Cuitauia | Coordina Christenner | Possible | | Neter |
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points 20 | Score | Notes |
| Transparency | | 20 | 10 | |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. | 10 | + | Joined RSPO in August 2014 ₁ |
| | 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. | | - | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan with intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | - | |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | - | |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | _ | |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | 5 | - | |

KRAFT FOODS

| | | Possible | | |
|------------------|--|----------|-------|-------------------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Current sourcing | | 20 | 0 | No data available |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | |
| Total | | 100 | 10 | |

References

1. Kraft RSPO Member Page: <u>http://www.rspo.org/members/2513/Kraft-Foods-Group-Inc</u>

Other Reviewed Materials

2. Corporate Responsibility Expectations for Direct Suppliers: <u>http://www.kraftfoodsgroup.com/deliciousworld/compliance-integrity/corporate_responsibility_expectations.aspx</u>

MONDELEZ

| | | Possible | | Notes |
|---|--|----------|-------|---|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | |
| Deforestation-Free | | 20 | (| |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to deforestation | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest | | - | "We are taking steps to ensure that the palm oil we buy is produced on legally held land, does not lead to deforestation or loss of peat land, respects human rights, including land rights, and does not use forced or child labor. Specifically, palm oil development should not take place in Primary Forest, High |
| | protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | Conservation Value (HCV) areas, High Carbon Stock (HCS) forests, or use fire in plantation operations." ₁ – Does not apply to palm kernel oil or derivatives |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | C | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to peatland destruction | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by committing to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | "We are taking steps to ensure that the palm oil we buy is produced on legally held land, does not lead to deforestation or loss of peat land" ₁ – Does not apply to palm kernel oil or derivatives |
| | 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion. | | - | |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Traceability | | 20 | 20 | |
| Commitment to tracing palm oil | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified. | 15 | + | "Increased transparency is vital to ensure best practices are being adopted and to build trust in the sector. As a first step, we are asking suppliers to implement traceability to the mills where fresh fruit bunches (FFB) are first processed into crude palm oil. While |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability. | | - | we recognize that traceability to the plantation or smallholder level can be extremely difficult we expect mills to be able to track and verify practices within their FFB supply base over time." ₁ "We have reviewed our approach with our palm oil suppliers and expect them to provide us transparency on the proportion of their supplies traceable to plantations meeting these principles by the end of 2013 During early 2014, we will review these results and publish an action plan during Q2 2014 to give priority to supplies that meet these principles, and eliminate supplies that do not, by 2020 at the latest." ₂ |
| Commitment to ask their suppliers about the GHG footprint of their production | Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.5 or 5.2 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies. | 5 | + | RSPO ACOP ₂ |

MONDELEZ

| | | Possible | | |
|--|--|----------|-------|---|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Transparency | | 20 | 15 | |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. | 10 | + | RSPO member and submitted 2013-2014 ACOP ₂ |
| | 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. | | - | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan with intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | - | "We are taking steps to ensure that the palm oil we buy is produced on legally held land, does not lead to deforestation or loss of peatland Specifically, palm oil development should not take place in Primary forest, High Conservation Value (HCV) areas, High Carbon Stock (HCS) forests, or use fire in plantation operations. We |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | - | have reviewed our approach with our palm oil suppliers and expect them to provide us transparency on the proportion of their supplies traceable to plantations meeting these principles by the end of 2013. During early 2014, we will review these results and publish an action plan during Q2 2014 to give priority to supplies that meet these principles, and eliminate supplies that do not, by 2020 at the latest. " $_2$ – Does not apply to palm kernel oil or derivatives "We require all suppliers to be able to demonstrate policy |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | - | implementation by year-end 2015, or to have time-bound implementation plans in place. At that time we will confirm the deadline for full implementation, and will expect it to be as soon as feasible after 2015." ₁ – Does not apply to palm kernel oil or derivatives |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | 5 | + | "In 2010 we ceased buying from a supplier following allegations of illegal forest clearance in its palm oil operations. Since then, we have engaged other suppliers, with the threat that we will withdraw our business where necessary. In the past year, we have carried out a structured program of supplier engagement which is the foundation for this action plan, including a traceability survey [see below], sustainability capability assessment and ongoing direct engagement." ₁ "Verification" RSPO certified or equivalent, plus credible third- party verification of criteria outside recognized standards." ₁ |

MONDELEZ

| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Possible Points | Score | Notes |
|------------------|--|--------------------|-------|---|
| Current sourcing | | 20 | 1.8 | Numbers taken from ACOP |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | $= 20 * \text{Mean} \begin{pmatrix} \frac{0+.5*(7360+8299+83)+.25*260914}{276573} \\ \frac{0+0+0}{20544} \\ \frac{0}{"Volumes for CPO and PKO include derivatives"} \end{pmatrix}$ *Note: Derivatives were included in PFO and PKO totals. We thus used the original formula but divided the total by all three sectors even though no derivatives were reported. |
| Total | | 100 | 36.8 | |

References

- 1. Palm Oil Action Plan: http://www.mondelezinternational.com/~/media/MondelezCorporate/uploads/downloads/Palm_Oil_Action_Plan.pdf
- 2. 2013-2014 ACOP: <u>http://www.rspo.org/file/acop2014/submissions/mondelez-international-inc-formerly-known-as-kraft-foods-europe-services-gmbh-ACOP2014.pdf</u>

Other Reviewed Materials

- 3. Mondelez International Shares Sustainable Palm Oil Action Plan: http://ir.mondelezinternational.com/releasedetail.cfm?releaseid=852377
- 4. Palm Oil Statement: http://www.mondelezinternational.com/~/media/MondelezCorporate/uploads/downloads/Palm Oil Statement.pdf
- 5. Supply Chain Transparency and Labor Practices: <u>http://www.mondelezinternational.com/about-us/compliance-and-integrity#supplyChain</u>
- 6. Program for Responsible Sourcing: <u>http://www.mondelezinternational.com/Procurement/Responsible-Sourcing/Program-for-Responsible-Sourcing-PROGRESS</u>
- 7. Responsible Sourcing: <u>http://www.mondelezinternational.com/well-being/sustainable-resources-and-agriculture/responsible-sourcing</u>
- 8. Sedex: <u>http://www.mondelezinternational.com/procurement/responsible-sourcing/supplier-ethical-data-exchange-sedex</u>

NESTLE

| | | Possible | | Notes |
|---|--|----------|-------|--|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | |
| Deforestation-Free | | 20 | 20 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to deforestation | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary forested OR commits to protection of HCV or primary | | + | "By making explicit provisions for peatlands and high-carbon stock forests, we go beyond the RSPO requirements and give more emphasis to the issue of deforestation, and to social conflict arising from potential land rights and acquisition disputes. Our category-specific requirements for palm oil call on our suppliers to source oil from plantations that: Comply with local laws and regulations; Do not come from |
| | forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | areas cleared of natural forest after November 2005; Respect the free, prior and informed consent of local and indigenous communities; Respect high conservation value forests; Protect peatlands and forests of high carbon value; and Comply with all RSPO principles and criteria." ₁ |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 20 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to peatland destruction | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by committing to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | + | "By making explicit provisions for peatlands and high-carbon stock forests, we go beyond the RSPO requirements and give more emphasis to the issue of deforestation, and to social conflict arising from potential land rights and acquisition disputes. Our category-specific requirements for palm oil call on our suppliers to source oil from plantations that Protect peatlands and forests of high carbon value; and |
| | 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion. | | - | <i>Comply with all RSPO principles and criteria.</i> ^{<i>"</i>} ₁ <i>"3.3 Date expected to be using 100% RSPO certified palm oil</i> |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | from physical supply chains (Identity Preserved, Segregated and/or Mass Balance) - own brand products: 2020" ₂ |
| Traceability | | 20 | 20 | |
| Commitment to tracing palm oil | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified. | 15 | | "Nestlé works progressively towards mapping the palm oil supply chain back to mill and plantation." ₂ "13% of our volume is Responsibly Sourced, meaning traceable to plantation, RSG assessed, compliant or engaged in continuous |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability. | | - | improvement. 5% of our volume is fully compliant, meaning traceable to plantation level and fully compliant against our Responsible Sourcing Guideline requirements." ₃ |
| Commitment to ask their suppliers about the GHG footprint of their production | Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.5 or 5.2 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies. | 5 | | "Suppliers identify and reduce their significant environmental impacts in a process of continuous improvement, which includes Greenhouse gas emissions are reduced"4 |

NESTLE

| | | Possible | | |
|--|--|----------|-------|--|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Transparency | | 20 | 20 | |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. | 10 | + | RSPO members and submitted 2013-2014 ACOP ₂ |
| | 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. | | - | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan with intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | + | "We consider three years as sufficient time for suppliers to show material progress towards delivering traceability and meeting our RSGs, and five years as the maximum time that it should take to be able to demonstrate compliance." ₅ "3.1 Date expected to/or started to use any RSPO certified palm oil |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | - | products - own brand: 2010. 3.2 Date expected to be using 100% RSPO certified palm oil products from any supply chain option – own Brand: 2013. 3.3 Date expected to be using 100% RSPO certified palm oil from physical supply chains (Identity Preserved, Segregated and/or Mass Balance) - own brand products: 2020″ ₂ |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | _ | |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | 5 | + | "In its extended value chains, Nestlé expects its suppliers to continuously monitor and verify their performance and continuous improvement against the RSG. In the case of high sustainability risks, Nestlé reserves the right to verify such monitoring and performance by independent assessments or certification." ₄ |

NESTLE

| | | Possible | | |
|------------------|--|----------|-------|---|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Current sourcing | | 20 | 10.5 | Percentages taken from Autumn 2013 Palm Oil Progress Report, ACOP |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | Because Nestlé is sourcing deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil which is not accounted for in ACOP reporting, we use a modified formula based on percentages rather than numbers. However, due to ACOP reporting we know that Nestle does not use palm fruit oil. Thus the modified formula is as follows: =20 *(%(PKO _{DPF} + POD _{DPF}) + % (.5(PKO _{CSPO} + PKO _{GP} + POD _{CSPO} + POD _{GP}))) 10.5 = 20 * (.05 + .5(95)) |
| Total | | 100 | 90.5 | ; |

References

- 1. Palm Oil: http://www.nestle.com/csv/rural-development-responsible-sourcing/responsible-sourcing/palm-oil
- 2. 2013-2014 ACOP: http://www.rspo.org/file/acop2014/submissions/nestle-sa-ACOP2014.pdf
- 3. Progress Report on Palm Oil Autumn 2013: <u>http://www.nestle.com/asset-library/documents/creating-shared-value/responsible-sourcing/progress-report-palm-oil-autumn-2013.pdf</u>
- 4. Nestle Responsible Sourcing Guidelines: <u>http://www.nestle.com/asset-library/documents/library/documents/corporate_social_responsibility/nestle-responsible-sourcing-guidelines.pdf</u>
- 5. Nestle Commitment on Deforestation and Forest Stewardship: <u>http://www.nestle.com/asset-</u> <u>library/documents/library/documents/corporate_social_responsibility/commitment-on-deforestation-2013.pdf</u>

Other Reviewed Materials

6. Nestle Commitment on the Responsible Use of Material from Agricultural Origin: <u>http://www.nestle.com/asset-library/documents/library/documents/suppliers/appendix-supplier-code-english.pdf</u>

PEPSICO

| | | Possible | | Notes |
|---|--|----------|-------|--|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | |
| Deforestation-Free | | 20 | 20 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to deforestation | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | + | "As we strive for zero deforestation in our business operations and supply chain, PepsiCo will adhere to the following principles No further development on High Carbon Stock (HCS) Forests. No further development on High Conservation Value (HCV) Forests." ₁ |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 20 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to peatland destruction | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by committing to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | + | "As we strive for zero deforestation in our business operations and supply chain, PepsiCo will adhere to the following principles No new conversion of Peatlands." ₁ "3.3 Date expected to be using 100% RSPO certified palm oil from physical supply chains (Identity Preserved, Segregated and/or Mass Balance) - own brand products: 2020" ₂ |
| | 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion. | | - | |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Traceability | | 20 | 20 | |
| Commitment to tracing palm oil | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified. 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability. | 15 | + | To further bolster our commitment, we are working with our suppliers to achieve 100% traceability to the mill level by 2016. In turn the mills will provide confirmation from the farms from which they source the palm oil. In this way we will have a fuller understanding of our palm oil supply chain." ₅ |
| Commitment to ask their suppliers about the GHG footprint of their production | Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.5 or 5.2 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies. | 5 | + | RSPO ACOP ₂ |

PEPSICO

| | | Possible | | |
|--|--|----------|-------|---|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Transparency | | 20 | 20 | |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. | 10 | + | RSPO member and submitted 2013-2014 ACOP ₂ |
| | 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. | | - | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan with intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | + | "In 2010, PepsiCo committed, through the Roundtable for Sustainable Palm Oil (RSPO), to source exclusively 100% RSPO certified sustainable palm oil by 2015. In 2013, PepsiCo further strengthened this commitment to purchase 100% Physical RSPO certified palm oil by 2020, providing additional visibility into our palm oil supply chain. While we are committed to the RSPO and its |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | - | pain on supply chain. While we are committed to the RSPO and its process and standards, we recognize that in some regions of the world, additional measures may be necessary. This is why we are further committing that by 2016, the palm oil that PepsiCo sources through our suppliers will be: sourced exclusively through suppliers who are members of the RSPO; confirmed to have originated from responsible and sustainable sources; in compliance with our Forestry Stewardship Policy. Our Forestry Stewardship Policy includes no further development on High |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | - | Carbon Stock (HCS) Forests or High Conservation Value (HCV Forests); no new conversion of peatlands ⁷ ₂ |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | 5 | + | "In addition, PepsiCo will • Provide appropriate grievance mechanisms for suppliers to report suspected breaches. • Leverage our Supplier Code of Conduct (SCoC) as a means of communicating PepsiCo's Forestry Stewardship Policy and associated commitments to our suppliers." ₃ "While we use our Supplier Code of Conduct to spell out our priorities, we use our Supplier Social Capability Management Program to communicate and educate our suppliers, validate compliance and facilitate continuous improvements within our supply chain." ₄ |

PEPSISCO

| Criteria | Coursing Carifornia | Possible | | |
|------------------------------|--|--------------|-------------|---|
| Criteria Current sourcing | Scoring Guidance | Points 20 | Score .7 | Notes Numbers taken from ACOP |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | $= 20 * \text{Mean} \begin{pmatrix} \frac{0+.5*23280+.25*62040}{409093} \\ No \ PKO \\ \frac{0+0+0}{55768} \end{pmatrix}$ |
| Total | | 100 | 80.7 | , |

References

- 1. PepsiCo Forestry Stewardship Policy: http://www.pepsico.com/Assets/Download/PepsiCo Forestry Stewardship Policy.pdf
- 2. 2013-2014 ACOP: http://www.rspo.org/file/acop2014/submissions/pepsico-ACOP2014.pdf
- 3. PepsiCo Palm Oil Commitments: http://www.pepsico.com/Assets/Download/PepsiCo Palm Oil Commitments.pdf
- 4. Responsible and Sustainable Sourcing: http://www.pepsico.com/Purpose/Environmental-Sustainability/Responsible-Sourcing
- 5. Commitments on Palm Oil, Cane Sugar, and Soy: <u>http://pepsico.com/Purpose/Performance-with-Purpose/Policies</u>

Other Reviewed Materials

- 6. PepsiCo Land Policy: http://www.pepsico.com/Assets/Download/PepsiCo Land_Policy.pdf
- 7. Sustainable Agriculture: <u>http://www.pepsico.com/purpose/Environmental-Sustainability/Agriculture</u>

UNILEVER

| | | Possible | | Notes |
|---|--|----------|-------|---|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | |
| Deforestation-Free | | 20 | 20 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to deforestation | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | + | "The following Principles are vital to create a sustainable palm oil industry: Halt deforestation • No development of High Carbon Stock (HCS) forests • No development of High Conservation Value (HCV) areas" ₁ |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 20 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to peatland destruction | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by committing to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | + | "The following Principles are vital to create a sustainable palm oil industry: Protect peat lands No new development on peat areas regardless of depth Apply Best Management Practices for existing plantations on peat |
| | 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion. | | - | Working with experts and stakeholders, explore options for peat restoration where feasible"₁ |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Traceability | | 20 | 15 | |
| Commitment to tracing palm oil | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified. 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability. | 15 | -+ | "As a result, Unilever is committed to source all of our palm o traceable to known and certified sources by 2020. Known sou Refers to an inbound supply chain capability to identify the or of palm oil used in the manufacturing of our products to a kno and identified universe of originating Crude Palm Oil Mills." ₁ |
| Commitment to ask their suppliers about the GHG footprint of their production | Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.5 or 5.2 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies. | 5 | + | ACOP ₂ |

UNILEVER

| | | Possible | | |
|--|--|----------|-------|--|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Transparency | | 20 | 20 | |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. | 10 | + | RSPO member and submitted 2013-2014 ACOP ₂ |
| | 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. | | - | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan with intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | + | "We will purchase all palm oil from sustainable sources by 2015. We will purchase all palm oil sustainably from certified, traceable sources by 2020." ₃ "3.1 Date expected to/or started to use any RSPO certified palm oil products - own brand: 2009. |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | - | 3.2 Date expected to be using 100% RSPO certified palm oil products from any supply chain option – own Brand: 2012 3.3 Date expected to be using 100% RSPO certified palm oil from physical supply chains (Identity Preserved, Segregated and/or Mass Balance) - own brand products: 2020″ ₂ |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | - | |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | 5 | + | "Unilever will work with growers, traders and processors to develop individual time-bound action plans to deliver a supply chain for certified sustainable palm oil. In working with suppliers, Unilever will conduct all of its operations in accordance with the principles of fair competition and applicable regulations including adherence to Unilever's Supplier Code." ₁ |

UNILEVER

| | | Possible | | |
|------------------|--|----------|-------|--|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Current sourcing | | 20 | 8.4 | Numbers taken from ACOP |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | $= 20 * \text{Mean} \begin{pmatrix} \frac{0+.5*9979.80+.25*302802.89}{312782.69} \\ \frac{0+0+.5*137587.53}{137587.53} \\ \frac{0+.5*1061187.85+.5*4515.43}{1065703.28} \end{pmatrix}$ |
| Total | | 100 | 83.4 | • |

References

- 1. Sustainable Palm Oil Sourcing Policy: http://www.unilever.com/images/Unilever_Sustainable_Palm_Oil_Sourcing_Policy_Nov_2013_tcm13-388376.pdf
- 2. 2013-2014 ACOP: http://www.rspo.org/file/acop2014/submissions/unilever-ACOP2014.pdf

Other Reviewed Materials

- 3. Sustainable Palm Oil Progress Report 2014: http://www.unilever.com/images/Unilever%20Sustainable%20Palm%20Oil%20Progress%20Report%20Nov%202014%20LR_tcm13-402609.pdf
- 4. Our Targets: <u>http://www.unilever.com/sustainable-living-2014/reducing-environmental-impact/sustainable-sourcing/sustainable-palm-oil/our-targets/index.aspx</u>
- 5. Working with Suppliers: <u>http://www.unilever.com/sustainable-living-2014/reducing-environmental-impact/sustainable-sourcing/sustainable-palm-oil/working-with-suppliers/</u>

Personal Care

AVON

| | | Possible | | Notes |
|---|--|----------|-------|---|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | |
| Deforestation-Free | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to deforestation | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. | | - | "Supports the current moratorium on the conversion of primary forests and peatland into palm oil plantations." ₁ - supporting a moratorium does not mean they are committed to these principles in the palm oil they source |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | _ | |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to peatland destruction | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by committing to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | "Supports the current moratorium on the conversion of primary forests and peatland into palm oil plantations." ₁ - supporting a moratorium does not mean they are committed to these principles in the palm oil they source |
| | 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion. | | - | |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Traceability | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to tracing palm oil | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified. | 15 | - | |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability. | | - | |
| Commitment to ask their suppliers about the GHG footprint of their production | Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.5 or 5.2 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies. | 5 | _ | |

AVON

| | | Possible | | |
|--|--|----------|-------|--|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Transparency | | 20 | 10 | |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. | 10 | + | RSPO members and submitted ACOP ₂ |
| | 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. | | - | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan, with intermediate goals, to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | - | |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | - | |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan, with no intermediate goals, to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | - | |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | 5 | - | |

| | | Possible | | |
|------------------|--|----------|-------|---|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Current sourcing | | 20 | 10 | Numbers taken from Question 3.7 on ACOP |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | $= 20 * Mean \begin{pmatrix} No PFO \\ No PKO \\ 0+0+.5*18400 \\ 18400 \end{pmatrix}$ Note: While numbers are not filled out in ACOP, received verification that all the palm oil Avon uses are derivatives. |
| Total | | 100 | 20 | |

References

- 1. Avon Palm Oil Promise: <u>http://www.avoncompany.com/corporatecitizenship/corporateresponsibility/sustainability/helpingenddeforestation/avon-palm-oil-promise.html</u>
- 2. 2013-2014 ACOP: http://www.rspo.org/file/acop2014/submissions/avon-products-inc-ACOP2014.pdf

Other Reviewed Materials

- 3. Manufacturing and Supply Chain: http://www.avoncompany.com/corporatecitizenship/corporateresponsibility/sustainability/managingourproductlifecycle/manufacturing-supply-chain.html
- 4. Supporting Reforestation: <u>http://www.avoncompany.com/corporatecitizenship/corporateresponsibility/sustainability/helpingenddeforestation/index.html</u>
- 5. Supplier Global Code of Conduct: <u>http://www.avoncompany.com/documents/corporateresponsibility/supplychain/Supplier_Code_of_Conduct.pdf</u>

BEIERSDORF

| | | Possible | | Notes |
|---|---|----------|-------------|--|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | |
| Deforestation-Free | | 20 | 10 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to deforestation | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. | | - | "We have made considerable progress towards changing to sustainable palm kernel oil only using ingredients from proven sustainable sources (Certified Sustainable Palm Kernel Oil). By 2020, we intend to |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | | switch the respective ingredients to segregated or at least mass balanced palm (kernel) oil and corresponding derivatives." ₁ |
| | | | + | <i>"3.3 Date expected to be using 100% RSPO certified palm oil from physical supply chains (Identity Preserved, Segregated and/or Mass Balance) - own brand products: 2020″</i> ² |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 5 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to peatland destruction | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by committing to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion. 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - - + | "we are active in the newly formed 'Forum für nachhaltiges Palmöl' (the German Forum for Sustainable Palm Oil) and are also an advocate for the further development of the existing certification criteria, the most important points of which are Stopping cultivation on peat soil and other surfaces with high carbon content" ₁ – Not strong enough language "3.3 Date expected to be using 100% RSPO certified palm oil from physical supply chains own brand products: 2020" ₂ |
| Traceability | | 20 | 15 | |
| Commitment to tracing palm oil | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified. 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to | 15 | - | "We have been working in close collaboration with our suppliers to create more transparency in the supply chai – in order to make the path of the raw material traceable all the way from the mill to its derivatives and to suppor the building and expansion of sustainable palm and pair |
| Commitment to ask | traceability. Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.5 or 5.2 | | + | kernel oil industry."2 |
| their suppliers about the GHG footprint of | on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies. | | + | |
| their production | | 5 | | |

BEIERSDORF

| Scoring Guidance | Possible Points 20 | Score 13 | Notes |
|--|--|--|--|
| Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to upperting | 10 | + | RSPO member and submitted 2013-2014 ACOP ₂ |
| Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan, with intermediate goals, to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source | 5 | - | <i>"By 2020, we intend to switch the respective ingredients to segregated or at least mass balanced palm (kernel) oil and corresponding derivatives. Until the changeover is complete, Beiersdorf will purchase certificates on the 'GreenPalm trading platform'. In</i> |
| 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | + | certificates on the 'GreenPaim trading platform'. In 2013, 100% of the palm oil and palm kernel oil equivalents contained in its ingredients were covered by certificates (excluding Beiersdorf Hair Care China). In 2014, the first raw materials will be physically switched to mass balance certified palm kernel oil. "1 "3.3 Date expected to be using 100% RSPO certified palm oil from physical supply chains (Identity Preserved, Segregated and/or Mass Balance) - own brand products: 2020" ₂ |
| 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan, with no intermediate goals, to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | - | |
| Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | | _ | |
| | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan, with intermediate goals, to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan, with no intermediate goals, to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan, with no intermediate goals, to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | 20 Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. 10 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan, with intermediate goals, to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan, with no intermediate goals, to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan, with no intermediate goals, to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all | 20 13 Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. + S points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. 10 Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan, with intermediate goals, to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. - 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil DR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. + 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan, with no intermediate goals, to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. - Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. - |

BEIERSDORF

| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Possible Points | Score | Notes |
|------------------|--|--------------------|-------|--|
| Current sourcing | | 20 | 8.3 | Numbers taken from ACOP |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | $= 20 * \text{Mean} \begin{pmatrix} \frac{0+0+.25*262}{262} \\ \frac{0+0+.5*434}{434} \\ \frac{0+0+.5*27575}{27575} \end{pmatrix}$ |
| Total | | 100 | 51.3 | |

References

1. Raw Materials: http://www.beiersdorf.com/sustainability/products/raw-materials

2. 2013-2014 ACOP: http://www.rspo.org/file/acop2014/submissions/beiersdorf-ag-ACOP2014.pdf

Other Reviewed Materials

- 3. Responsible Sourcing: <u>http://www.beiersdorf.com/sustainability/our-commitment/responsible-sourcing</u>
- 4. About Us, Forum Nachhaltiges Palmol: <u>http://www.forumpalmoel.org/en/ueber-uns/was-wir-tun.html</u>

CLOROX

| | | Dessible | | Notes |
|--|--|--------------------|---------|-------|
| Criteria | Scoring Cuidance | Possible Points | Score | NOLES |
| | Scoring Guidance | 20 | score 0 | |
| Deforestation-Free | | 20 | U | |
| Commitment to | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all | | | |
| source palm oil that | forests and include language referring to secondary, | | | |
| does not contribute to | disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. | | - | |
| deforestation | | | | |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest | | | |
| | protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary | | | |
| | forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or | | | |
| | sustainable palm oil. | | | |
| | | | - | |
| | | | | |
| | | | | |
| | | | | |
| | | | | |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm | | | |
| source palm oil that | oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and | | | |
| does not contribute to | if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that | | | |
| peatland destruction | those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that | | - | |
| | are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs | | | |
| | requirement can be fulfilled by physically sourcing 100% | | | |
| | CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | | |
| | 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland | | | |
| | protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new | | | |
| | conversion. | | - | |
| | | | | |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO | | _ | |
| | or sustainable palm oil. | | | |
| Traceability | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil | | | |
| tracing palm oil | to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to | | | |
| | the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose | | - | |
| | | 15 | | |
| | tracing can be verified. | - | | |
| | tracing can be verified. 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to | | | |
| | 0 | | - | |
| Commitment to ask | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability. | | - | |
| Commitment to ask | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability. Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.5 or 5.2 | | - | |
| Commitment to ask their suppliers about the GHG footprint of | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability. | | - | |

CLOROX

| | | Dessible | | |
|--|--|--------------------|-------|-------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidanco | Possible Points | Score | Notes |
| | Scoring Guidance | 20 | 0 | |
| Transparency | | 20 | 0 | |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. | 10 | - | |
| | 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. | | - | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan, with intermediate goals, to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | _ | |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | _ | |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan, with no intermediate goals, to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | - | |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | 5 | - | |

CLOROX

| | | Possible | | |
|------------------|--|----------|-------|-------------------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Current sourcing | | 20 | 0 | No data available |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | |
| Total | | 100 | 0 | |

Reviewed Materials

- 1. Strategy 4: Fund growth by reducing waste in our work, products and supply chain: http://annualreport.thecloroxcompany.com/strategy_ourStrategies_fundgrowth
- 2. Setting Our 2020 Business Strategy: <u>http://annualreport.thecloroxcompany.com/strategy_goalsMeasures</u>
- 3. Supplier Code of Conduct: <u>https://www.thecloroxcompany.com/downloads/supplier_codeconduct09.pdf</u>
- 4. Monitoring and Compliance: <u>http://www.thecloroxcompany.com/downloads/clorox-business-partner-code-of-conduct.pdf</u>

COLGATE-PALMOLIVE

| | | Possible | | Notes |
|---|--|----------|-------|--|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | |
| Deforestation-Free | | 20 | 20 | |
| <i>Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to deforestation</i> | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. | | + | "Further, we will require additional independent verification that the palm oil supply to Colgate does not come from areas where High Carbon Stocks (HCS) and High Conservation Value (HCV) forests were |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | deforested"1 |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 20 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to peatland destruction | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | + | "Further, we will require additional independent verification that the palm oil supply to Colgate does not come from areas where:Peat lands (regardless of depth) were developed into plantations or drained. We will also require best management practices for existing plantations on peat and, where feasible, peat restoration." ₁ |
| | 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion. | | - | |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Traceability | | 20 | 20 | |
| Commitment to tracing palm oil | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose | | + | <i>"We will… Achieve full traceability of our palm oil supply chain back to the plantation by 2015."</i> ₁ |
| | tracing can be verified. 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability. | 15 | - | |
| Commitment to ask their suppliers about the GHG footprint of | Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.5 or 5.2 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies. | | + | RSPO ACOP ₂ |
| their production | | 5 | | |

COLGATE-PALMOLIVE

| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Possible Points | Score | Notes |
|--|--|--------------------|-------|--|
| Transparency | | 20 | 20 | |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. | 10 | + | RSPO member and submitted 2013-2014 ACOP ₂ |
| | 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. | | - | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan, with intermediate goals, to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | + | "Given the insufficient current supply of sustainable certified palm kernel oil, Colgate took the interim step in 2013 of purchasing GreenPalm Certificates to cover 100 percent of our requirements We set a new target date of 2020 for buying only certified sustainable palm oil and |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | - | derivatives whose sources can be tracked from plantation to product, and are now adding the additional compliance requirements outlined below As the next step on our journey toward sustainable palm oil, we will: Achieve full traceability of our palm oil supply chain back to the plantation by 2015Where possible increase our purchase of physical Certified Sustainable Palm Oil and Palm Kernel Oil each year Continue to purchase GreenPalm |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan, with no intermediate goals, to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | - | Certificates to cover the remaining percentage of our requirements, gradually phasing out the need for the purchase each year." ₁ |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | | + | "To confirm compliance, we will require extensive supplier auditing and evidence and will use independent certification and verification scenarios, along with monitoring tools such as the Global Forest Watch." ₁ |
| | | 5 | | |

COLGATE-PALMOLIVE

| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Possible Points | Score | Notes |
|------------------|--|--------------------|-------|--|
| Current sourcing | | 20 | 8 | Numbers taken from ACOP |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | $= 20 * \text{Mean} \begin{pmatrix} \frac{0+0+.25*7867}{7867} \\ \frac{0+.5*1184+.5*32887}{38479} \\ \frac{0+0+.5*47542}{47542} \end{pmatrix}$ |
| Total | | 100 | 88 | |

References

1. Our Policy on No Deforestation: <u>http://www.colgate.com/app/Colgate/US/Corp/LivingOurValues/Sustainability/Deforestation.cvsp</u>

2. 2013-2014 ACOP: http://www.rspo.org/file/acop2014/submissions/colgate-palmolive-company-ACOP2014.pdf

Other Reviewed Materials

3. Spotlight on...Suppliers: http://www.colgate.com/Colgate/US/Corp_v2/LivingOurValues/Sustainability_v2/11_Colgate_Sustainability_Report_Suppliers_2014.pdf

ESTEE LAUDER

| | | Possible | | Notes |
|---|--|----------|-------|--|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | |
| Deforestation-Free | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to deforestation | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. | | - | "We have adopted a no-deforestation policy, which requires our high-volume suppliers to ensure that they prohibit new clearing or palm development on High Carbo[n] Stock (HCS), High Conservation Value (HCV) forests and peat lands or the use of fire for the preparation of new planting or re-planting." ₁ |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | _ | – Commitment does not cover all palm oil |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to peatland destruction | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | "We have adopted a no-deforestation policy, which requires our high-volume suppliers to ensure that they prohibit new clearing or palm development on High Carbo[n] Stock (HCS), High Conservation Value (HCV) forests and peat lands or the use of fire for the preparation of new planting or re-planting." ₁ – Commitment does not cover all palm oil |
| | 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion. | | - | |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Traceability | | 20 | 10 | |
| Commitment to tracing palm oil | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified. | 15 | _ | <i>"We will work collaboratively with our high volume suppliers to support and establish source."</i> ₁ |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability. | | + | |
| Commitment to ask their suppliers about the GHG footprint of | Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.5 or 5.2 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies. | | - | |
| their production | | 5 | | |

ESTEE LAUDER

| | | Possible | | |
|--|--|----------|-------|--|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Transparency | | 20 | 15 | |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. | 10 | + | RSPO member ₁ |
| | 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. | | - | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan, with intermediate goals, to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | - | |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | - | |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan, with no intermediate goals, to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | _ | |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | | + | "By the end of 2015 all suppliers of ELC's high-volume palm oil, PKO and PKO derived ingredients will be required to provide third-party verification that they are complying with our no deforestation policy." ₁ |

ESTEE LAUDER

| | | Possible | | |
|------------------|--|----------|-------|---|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Current sourcing | | 20 | 3.3 | |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | $= 20 * \text{Mean} \begin{pmatrix} \frac{0+.5*100+0}{100} \\ \frac{0+0+0}{PKO} \\ \frac{0+0+0}{POD} \end{pmatrix}$ "We source all of this palm fruit oil from Roundtable on Sustainable Palm Oil (RSPO) identity-preserved sources." |
| Total | | 100 | 28.3 | |

References

1. Palm Oil: <u>http://www.elcompanies.com/Pages/Palm-Oil.aspx</u>

Other Reviewed Materials

2. Corporate Responsibility Report: <u>http://www.elcompanies.com/PdfLibrary/2014_ELC_Corporate_Responsibility_Report.pdf</u>

HENKEL

| | | Possible | | Notes |
|---|--|--|-------|--|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | |
| Deforestation-Free | | 20 | 20 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to deforestation | to forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. + 2020. This means that palm and palm k we use should not contribute to defore primary or secondary forests with signing | "We are committed to zero net deforestation by 2020. This means that palm and palm kernel oil that we use should not contribute to deforestation of primary or secondary forests with significant | | |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | ecological value. This includes "High Carbon Stock" forests and peat lands." ₁ |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 20 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to peatland destruction | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | + | "We are committed to zero net deforestation by 2020. This means that palm and palm kernel oil that we use should not contribute to deforestation of primary or secondary forests with significant ecological value. This includes "High Carbon Stock" forests and peat lands." ₁ |
| | 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion. | | - | "Date expected to be using 100% RSPO certified palm oil from physical supply chains (Identity Preserved, Segregated and/or Mass Balance) – own brand products: 2018" ₂ |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Traceability | | 20 | 20 | |
| Commitment to tracing palm oil | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified. | 15 | + | "We are working with our partners to establish full traceability of palm and palm kernel oils used in ingredients for our productsby 2020 We are establishing pilot projects to trace palm and palm kernel |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability. | | - | oil that we use back to the plantations in order to ensure the oil that we use is being cultivated sustainably." $_1$ |
| Commitment to ask their suppliers about the GHG footprint of | Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.5 or 5.2 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies. | | + | ACOP ₂ |
| their production | | 5 | | |

HENKEL

| | | Possible | | |
|--|--|----------|-------|---|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Transparency | | 20 | 20 | |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to | 10 | + | RSPO member and submitted 2013-2014 ACOP ₂ |
| | reporting. | | - | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan, with intermediate goals, to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | + | "We are committed to zero net deforestation by 2020. This means that palm and palm kernel oil that we use should not contribute to deforestation of primary or secondary forests with significant ecological value. This includes "High Carbon Stock" forests and peat lands." ₁ |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | - | "Date expected to be using 100% RSPO certified palm of products from any supply chain option - own Brand: 2015. Date expected to be using 100% RSPO certified palm oil from physical supply chains (Identity Preserved, Segregated and/or Mass Balance) - own bran products: 2018" ₂ |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan, with no intermediate goals, to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | - | |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | 5 | + | "We are establishing pilot projects to trace palm and palm kernel oil that we use back to the plantations in order to ensure the oil that we use is being cultivated sustainably." ₁ "We carry out regular audits based on our risk-based audit planning at our production and administration sites, and at our subcontractors and in logistics centers to verify compliance with our codes and standards." ₃ |

HENKEL

| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Possible Points | Score | Notes |
|------------------|--|--------------------|-------|--|
| Current sourcing | | 20 | 6.3 | Numbers taken from ACOP |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | $= 20 * \text{Mean} \begin{pmatrix} \frac{0+0+.25*12}{12} \\ \frac{0+0+.5*.4}{.4} \\ \frac{0+0+.5*28630}{74489} \end{pmatrix}$ |
| Total | | 100 | 86.3 | |

References

1. Sustainable palm and palm kernel oil production: <u>http://www.henkel.com/sustainability/dialog-and-contacts/positions/palm-oil#Tab-23440_3</u>

2. 2013-2014 ACOP: http://www.rspo.org/file/acop2014/submissions/henkel-ag-co-kgaa-ACOP2014.pdf

3. Henkel Sustainability Report 2013: <u>http://sustainabilityreport.henkel.com/fileadmin/mpm_data/NB_2013_PDFs/Henkel_NB2013_en.pdf</u>

Other Reviewed Materials

4. Worldwide purchasing markets: <u>http://www.henkel.com/partners-and-suppliers/suppliers</u>

5. Internal audits: <u>http://sustainabilityreport.henkel.com/management/internal-audits/</u>

| | | Possible | | Notes |
|---|--|----------|-------|---|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | |
| Deforestation-Free | | 20 | 10 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to deforestation | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. | | - | "By 2020, Kao commits to zero deforestation at the source of palm oil through cooperation with plantations, suppliers (mills and refineries) and third- party organizations. We will not purchase palm oil |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | + | that contributes to development of any high conservation value (HCV) forests, high carbon stock (HCS) forests or peat lands, regardless of the depth." ₁ – only applies to Kao Group consumer products "Date expected to be using 100% RSPO certified palm oil from physical supply chains (Identity Preserved, Segregated and/or Mass Balance) - own brand products: 2020." ₂ |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 5 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to peatland destruction | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | "We will not purchase palm oil that contributes to development of any high conservation value (HCV) forests, high carbon stock (HCS) forests or peat lands, regardless of the depth." ₁ - only applies to Kao Group consumer products "Date expected to be using 100% RSPO certified palm |
| | 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion. | | - | oil from physical supply chains (Identity Preserved, Segregated and/or Mass Balance) - own brand products: 2020." ₂ |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | + | |
| Traceability | | 20 | 15 | |
| Commitment to tracing palm oil | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified. 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to | 15 | - | "By 2020, Kao will purchase only sustainably sourced palm oil that is traceable to the plantation for use in K Group consumer products. By 2020, Kao will work to obtain RSPO*1 SCCS*2 certification of Kao Group factories in order to build a traceable supply chain for |
| | traceability. | | + | <i>Kao Group."</i> ₁ –only for consumer products |
| Commitment to ask their suppliers about the GHG footprint of | Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.5 or 5.2 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies. | | + | RSPO ACOP ₂ |
| their production | | 5 | | |

| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Possible Points | | Score | Notes |
|--|--|--------------------|---|-------|---|
| Transparency | | 20 | 0 | 18 | |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. | 10 | + | + | RSPO member and submitted 2013-2014 ACOP |
| | 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. | | | - | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan, with intermediate goals, to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | 5 | - | "By 2020, Kao commits to zero deforestation at the source of palm oil through cooperation with plantations, suppliers (mills and refineries) and third-party organizations. We will not purchase palm oil that contributes to development of any high conservation |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | | + | value (HCV) forests, high carbon stock (HCS) forests or peat lands, regardless of the depth" ₁ - only covers Ka Group consumer products "Date expected to be using 100% RSPO certified palm of products from any supply chain option - own brand: 2015Date expected to be using 100% RSPO certified palm oil from physical supply chains (Identity Preserved Segregated and/or Mass Balance) - own brand product 2020." ₂ |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan, with no intermediate goals, to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | | - | |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | | | + | "We will notify all our suppliers that they should comply with Kao guidelines. If our suppliers are found in contravention of Kao guidelines, we will take appropriate action including auditing of our suppliers." ₁ |
| | | 5 | 5 | | |

| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Possible Points 20 | Score 6.8 | Notes |
|------------------|--|--------------------------|-----------|--|
| Current sourcing | | 20 | 0.0 | |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | $= 20 * \text{Mean} \begin{pmatrix} \frac{0+.5*3750+0}{3750} \\ \frac{0+.5*11340+.5*4535}{15875} \\ \frac{0+.5*500+.5*1706}{76500} \end{pmatrix}$ *Note: Received clarification about a small inconsistency in ACOP reporting and have used the correct numbers here |
| Total | | 100 | 54.8 | 3 |

References

1. Guidelines for Sustainable Procurement of Raw Materials: <u>http://www.kao.com/jp/en/corp_csr/procurement_05.html</u>

2. 2013-2014 ACOP: http://www.rspo.org/file/acop2014/submissions/kao-corporation-ACOP2014.pdf

Other Reviewed Materials

3. Kao Sustainability Report: <u>http://www.kao.co.jp/corp/sustainability-reports/en/pdf/</u>

L'OREAL

| | | Possible | | Notes |
|---|--|----------|-------|---|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | |
| Deforestation-Free | | 20 | 20 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to deforestation | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. | | + | "L'ORÉAL commits to ultimately work with suppliers whose responsible practices can guaranteeThe conservation and restoration of High Conservation Value and High Carbon stocks Areas when expanding palm plantations" 1 |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | "By 2020 the latest: 100% of palm supply will be free from deforestation." ₁ |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 20 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to peatland destruction | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by physical sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | + | "L'ORÉAL commits to ultimately work with suppliers whose responsible practices can guaranteeThe renouncement to peat clearance for new plantations and the adoption of a responsible maintenance system of peatlands in existing plantation." ₁ |
| | 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion. | | - | |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | _ | |
| Traceability | | 20 | 10 | |
| Commitment to tracing palm oil | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified. | 15 | - | <i>"L'ORÉAL will require from its suppliers that all supplies are traceable back through the supply chain to each of the company plantation or to suppliers' fields or mills."</i> ₁ |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability. | | + | |
| Commitment to ask their suppliers about the GHG footprint of their production | Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.5 or 5.2 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies. | 5 | - | "L'Oréal does not ask its suppliers to disclose their GHG emissions within the RSPO P&C 5.6 & 7.8. However, as part of its sustainability strategy, L'Oréal has set clear target for its plants and distribution centres: to reduce by 60 percent greenhouse gas emissions by 2020." 2- not strong enough |

L'OREAL

| | | Possible | | |
|--|--|----------|-------|--|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Transparency | | 20 | 20 | |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. | 10 | + | RSPO member and submitted 2013-2014 ACOP ₂ |
| | 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. | | - | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan, with intermediate goals, to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | + | "From today, L'ORÉAL will preferably work with suppliers who comply with the previous 4 points and who can demonstrate that palm supplies are free from deforestation notably by increasing traceability back to the plantations or supplier's mills. In the meantime L'ORÉAL will continue to actively support RSPO |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | - | certification process with the objective of progressively accessing to physically segregated sustainable palm derivatives (SG or MB model). By 2015, 100% palm oil and major palm derivatives should come from known sources. By 2020 the latest: 100% of palm supply will be free from deforestation." ₁ |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan, with no intermediate goals, to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | - | |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | | + | "From today, L'ORÉAL will preferably work with suppliers who comply with the previous 4 points and who can demonstrate that palm supplies are free from deforestation notably by increasing traceability back to the plantations or supplier's mills." ₁ "This is why our approach is to work in close collaboration with our first-tier suppliers to train them to recognize palm oil |
| | | 5 | | cultivation challenges and build with them a common strategy that is technically feasible and economically viable in order to deliver sustainable palm oil to the group." ₂ |

L'OREAL

| | | Possible | | |
|------------------|--|----------|-------|--|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Current sourcing | | 20 | 10 | Numbers taken from ACOP |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | $= 20 * Mean \left(\frac{\frac{0 + .5 * 450 + 0}{450}}{No \ PKO} \right)$ |
| Total | | 100 | 80 | |

References

1. Zero Deforestation Commitment: http://www.forumpalmoel.org/fileadmin/user_uploads/NEWS/L_Oreal.pdf

2. 2013-2014 ACOP: http://www.rspo.org/file/acop2014/submissions/l-oreal-ACOP2014.pdf

Other Reviewed Materials

- 3. L'Oreal Expands 'Sharing Beauty with All' Sustainability Pledge to Include Zero Deforestation: <u>http://www.sustainablebrands.com/news_and_views/supply_chain/sustainable_brands/loreal_expands_sharing_beauty_all_sustainability_pled</u>
- 4. Our Evaluation Criteria: <u>http://www.loreal.com/profiles/suppliers/our-evaluation-criteria.aspx</u>

PROCTER & GAMBLE

| | | Possible | | Notes |
|---|--|----------|-------|--|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | |
| Deforestation-Free | | 20 | 20 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to deforestation | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. | | + | "Ensure our suppliers meet RSPO criteria and have policies and procedures in place to ensure: No development of high conservation value (HCV) areas and high carbon stock (HCS) forests." ₁ |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 20 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to peatland destruction | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | + | "Ensure our suppliers meet RSPO criteria and have policies and procedures in place to ensure:No new development of peat lands regardless of depth." ₁ |
| | 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion. | | - | |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Traceability | | 20 | 20 | |
| Commitment to tracing palm oil | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified. | 15 | + | "In April, we reinforced this commitment with an announcement of goals calling for traceability of palm oil and palm kernel oil to our supplier mills by December 31, 2015, and to plantations by 2020." ₁ |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability. | | - | |
| Commitment to ask their suppliers about the GHG footprint of their production | Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.5 or 5.2 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies. | 5 | + | RSPO ACOP ₃ |

PROCTER & GAMBLE

| | | Possible | | |
|--|--|----------|-------|---|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Transparency | | 20 | 20 | |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. | 10 | + | RSPO member and submitted 2013-2014 ACOP ₃ |
| | 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. | | - | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan, with intermediate goals, to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | + | "Ensuring no deforestation in the palm supply chain to plantations by 2020" ₂ "The following actions will apply to our purchases of palm oil and palm oil fractions: We will establish traceability to palm oil mills by December 31, 2015. We will require suppliers to submit plans |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | - | by December 31, 2015. We will require suppliers to subinit plans by December 31, 2015 to demonstrate how they will ensure no deforestation in their supply chain by 2020. As we advance progress against the goals above, we also will continue to purchase 100% RSPO certified palm oil. The following actions will apply to our purchase of palm kernel oil: We will establish traceability to palm kernel oil mills by December 31, 2015 Palm Oil Derivatives and Palm Kernel Oil Derivatives: We will require suppliers to put forward time-bound plans by end of 2016 to |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan, with no intermediate goals, to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | - | demonstrate how they will ensure no deforestation in their supply chains." ₂ |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | 5 | + | "For palm oil, require suppliers to submit plans by December 31, 2015 that demonstrate how they will ensure no deforestation in the supply chain for their mills by 2020We will invest in and work with palm kernel oil suppliers, and the smallholders who supply them, with the aim of improving both practices and livelihoods to establish zero-deforestation in our supply chain by 2020. Palm Oil Derivatives and Palm Kernel Oil Derivatives: We will require suppliers to put forward time-bound plans by end of 2016 to demonstrate how they will ensure no deforestation in their supply chains." ₂ |

PROCTER & GAMBLE

| | | Possible | | |
|------------------|--|----------|-------|--|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Current sourcing | | 20 | 4.2 | Numbers taken from ACOP |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | $= 20 * \text{Mean} \begin{pmatrix} \frac{0+0+.25*85581.40}{85581.40} \\ \frac{0+.5*87725+.5*32500}{318068.42} \\ \frac{0+0+.5*47790.93}{128944.98} \end{pmatrix}$ |
| Total | | 100 | 84.2 | |

References

1. 2014 Sustainability Report: http://www.pg.com/en_US/downloads/sustainability/reports/PG_2014_Sustainability_Report.pdf

2. Palm Oil: <u>http://www.pg.com/en_US/sustainability/policies_practices/palmoil.shtml</u>

3. 2013-2014 ACOP: http://www.rspo.org/file/acop2014/submissions/pg-ACOP2014.pdf

Other Reviewed Materials

- 4. 2014 Sustainability Report: http://www.pg.com/en_US/downloads/sustainability/reports/PG_2014_Sustainability_Report.pdf
- 5. Climate Change: http://www.pg.com/en_US/sustainability/policies_practices/climate.shtml
- 6. Environmental Sustainability Scorecard: <u>http://www.pgsupplier.com/en/current-suppliers/environmental-sustainability-scorecard.shtml</u>
- 7. Overview of palm oil supply chain: http://www.pg.com/en_US/downloads/sustainability/reports/PG_PalmOil_Overview.pdf

RECKITT BENCKISER

| | | Possible | | Notes |
|---|--|----------|-------|---|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | |
| Deforestation-Free | | 20 | 20 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to deforestation | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. | | + | "RB fully supports the goal of no deforestation or degradation of peatlands (of any depth), primary or High Carbon Stock forests, or High Conservation Value areas associated with the cultivation of palm oil." ₁ |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | "Natural raw materials (and their derivatives) must be from sources thatdo not contribute towards the deforestation or degradation of peatlands of any depth, primary forests or High Conservation Value areas as defined by the HCV Network." 2 |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 15 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to peatland destruction | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | "RB fully supports the goal of no deforestation or degradation of peatlands (of any depth), primary or High Carbon Stock forests, or High Conservation Value areas associated with the cultivation of palm oil." ₁ |
| | 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion. | | + | |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Traceability | | 20 | 20 | |
| Commitment to tracing palm oil | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified. 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability. | 15 | + | " Suppliers of palm oil (or palm oil derivatives) to RB companies must achieve full traceability over their palm oil supply chain back to mills, and ultimately plantations, and ensure supply chain compliance." ₂ |
| Commitment to ask their suppliers about the GHG footprint of their production | Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.5 or 5.2 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies. | 5 | + | ACOP ₃ "Suppliers of palm oil (or palm oil derivatives) to RB companies mustShare with RB any palm oil grower's GHG reporting to the RSPO." ₂ |

RECKITT BENCKISER

| | | Possible | | |
|--|---|----------|-------|---|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Transparency | | 20 | 15 | |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. | 10 | + | RSPO member and 2013-2014 ACOP submitted ₃ |
| | 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. | | - | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan, with intermediate goals, to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | - | "As part of this work, we've achieved traceability to refinery for 100% of our palm volumes (excluding surfactants). Following on from this, our next steps are to: • work with palm oil suppliers to trace palm oil back to mills by end 2015 • carry out pilot supplier risk assessment by end 2014 • roll out supplier assessments to our |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015 | | - | key palm oil suppliers by end 2015 • work with TFT to define and implement next steps (including defining the timeline for full compliance) following completion of risk assessments by end 2015Regarding 3.3 above, the date for 100% coverage will depend on progress of the industry as a whole towards certified sustainable palm oil production and distribution. The 2020 date assumes a significant shift in the market to CSPO. The timescale could be beyond 2020 if we assume a worst case scenario (based |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan, with no intermediate goals, to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | - | on the complexity of the palm oil supply chain and the practical challenges with physical CSPO for 100% volumes)." ₃ – States elsewhere on ACOP does not have plans to source 100% CSPO through physical supply chains. |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | 5 | + | "Working with TFT, we have reviewed and updated our sourcing standards and are undertaking a detailed review of our physical palm oil supply chain our next steps are tocarry out pilot supplier risk assessment by end 2014, roll out supplier assessments to our key palm oil suppliers by end 201, work with TFT to define and implement next steps." ₁ "RB's SVP Purchasing is responsible for distributing and monitoring this standard." ₂ |

RECKITT BENCKISER

| | | Possible | | |
|------------------|--|----------|-------|--|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Current sourcing | | 20 | 2.3 | Numbers taken from ACOP |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | $= 20 * \text{Mean} \begin{pmatrix} \frac{0+0+.25*17282}{23773} \\ \frac{0+0+.5*100}{11000} \\ \frac{0+0+.5*22718}{69639} \end{pmatrix}$ |
| Total | | 100 | 72.3 | |

References

1. Better Design: <u>https://www.rb.com/our-responsibility/better-design</u>

2. Standard for the Responsible Sourcing of Natural Raw Materials & zero deforestation: http://www.rb.com/documentdownload.axd?documentresourceid=74094

3. 2013-2014 ACOP: <u>http://www.rspo.org/file/acop2014/submissions/reckitt-benckiser-plc-ACOP2014.pdf</u>

Other Reviewed Materials

4. Responsible Sourcing and Production: A Guide for Suppliers: <u>http://www.rb.com/documentdownload.axd?documentresourceid=37780</u>

Fast Food

BURGER KING

| | | Possible | | Notes |
|---|--|----------|-------|-------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | |
| Deforestation-Free | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to deforestation | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. | | _ | |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to peatland destruction | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by committing to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| | 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion. | | - | |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Traceability | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to tracing palm oil | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified. 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to | 15 | - | |
| | traceability. | | - | |
| Commitment to ask their suppliers about the GHG footprint of their production | Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.6 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies. | 5 | - | |

BURGER KING

| | | Possible | | |
|--|--|----------|-------|-------------------------------------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Transparency | | 20 | 10 | |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. | 10 | + | RSPO member as of 2014 ₁ |
| | 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. | | - | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan, with intermediate goals, to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | - | |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | - | |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan, with no intermediate goals, to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | _ | |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | 5 | - | |

BURGER KING

| | | Possible | | |
|------------------|--|----------|-------|-------------------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Current sourcing | | 20 | 0 | No data available |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm | | | |
| Total | (PFO _{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | 100 | 10 | |

References

1. RSPO Member Page: <u>http://www.rspo.org/members/2696/Burger-King-Corporation</u>

Other Reviewed Materials

- 2. Palm Oil Fact Sheet: <u>http://burgerking.pl/cms/en/us/cms_out/digital_assets/files/pages/PalmOilFactSheet.pdf</u>
- 3. Corporate Governance Report: <u>http://burgerking.pl/cms/en/us/cms_out/digital_assets/files/pages/BK_CR_Report_Corporate_Governance.pdf</u>

CKE RESTAURANTS

| | | Possible | | Notes |
|------------------------|--|-----------|-------|-------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Possible | Score | |
| | | 20 | 0 | |
| Deforestation-Free | | 20 | U | |
| Commitment to | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all | | | |
| source palm oil that | forests and include language referring to secondary, | | | |
| does not contribute to | disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. | | - | |
| deforestation | | | | |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest | | | |
| | protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary | | | |
| | forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or | | | |
| | sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| | | | | |
| | | | | |
| | | | | |
| | | | | |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm | | | |
| source palm oil that | oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and | | | |
| does not contribute to | if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that | | | |
| peatland destruction | those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that | | - | |
| | are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs | | | |
| | requirement can be fulfilled by committing to physically | | | |
| | source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | | |
| | 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland | | | |
| | protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new | | | |
| | conversion. | | - | |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO | | | |
| | or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · | 20 | 0 | |
| Traceability | Full 4F mainter A company much a supplicit to the set its set in the | 20 | U | |
| Commitment to | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil | | | |
| tracing palm oil | to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to | | | |
| | the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose | 15 | - | |
| | tracing can be verified. 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to | 15 | | |
| | traceability. | | - | |
| Commitment to ask | Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.6 on the | | | |
| their suppliers about | 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other | | _ | |
| the GHG footprint of | policies. | | | |
| | | | | |

CKE RESTAURANTS

| o :: | | Possible | 6 | |
|--|--|----------|-------|-------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Transparency | | 20 | 0 | |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. | 10 | - | |
| | 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. | | - | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan, with intermediate goals, to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | - | |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | - | |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan, with no intermediate goals, to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | - | |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | 5 | - | |

CKE RESTAURANTS

| | | Possible | | |
|------------------|--|----------|-------|-------------------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Current sourcing | | 20 | 0 | No data available |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | |
| Total | | 100 | 0 | |

No relevant materials found

DAIRY QUEEN

| | | Possible | | Notes |
|--|--|----------|-------|-------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | |
| | | 20 | 0 | |
| Deforestation-Free Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to deforestation | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. | | - | |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | 20 | - | |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 0 | |
| <i>Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to peatland destruction</i> | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by committing to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| | 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion. | | - | |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Traceability | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to tracing palm oil | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified. | 15 | - | |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability. | | - | |
| Commitment to ask their suppliers about the GHG footprint of their production | Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.6 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies. | 5 | - | |

DAIRY QUEEN

| | | Deerth | | | |
|--|--|--------------------|-------|---|--|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Possible Points | Score | | |
| Transparency | | 20 | 0 | 0 | |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. | 10 | - | | |
| | 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. | | - | | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan, with intermediate goals, to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | _ | | |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | - | | |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan, with no intermediate goals, to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | _ | | |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | 5 | - | | |

DAIRY QUEEN

| | | Possible | | |
|------------------|--|----------|-------|-------------------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Current sourcing | | 20 | 0 | No data available |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | |
| Total | | 100 | 0 | |

No relevant materials found

DOMINO'S

| | | Possible | | Notes |
|---|--|----------|-------|-------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | |
| Deforestation-Free | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to deforestation | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. | | _ | |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 0 | |
| <i>Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to peatland destruction</i> | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by committing to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| | 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion. | | - | |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Traceability | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to tracing palm oil | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified. | 15 | - | |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability. | | - | |
| Commitment to ask their suppliers about the GHG footprint of | Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.6 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies. | | - | |
| their production | | 5 | | |

DOMINO'S

| TransparencyAnnual reporting of progressFull 1 inclu that is sus repoTime bound goals to physically source palm oilFull 5 inclu that inter peat- inter peat- plan CSPC3 poi inter plan CSPCWITH 100% | I 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; luding disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil t meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or ustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and borting through the ACOP. oints: A company has made a vague commitment to borting. I 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan, with ermediate goals, to physically source deforestation-free, at-free palm oil OR a company does not have ermediate goals, but commits to physically source forestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | Possible Points 20 10 | Score O | Notes |
|--|--|--------------------------------|------------|-------|
| TransparencyAnnual reporting of progressFull 1 inclu that is sus repo5 poi repo7 Time bound goals to physically source palm oilFull 5 inter peat- inter defor3 poi inter plan CSPC9 Annual reporting of sus physically source palm oil | I 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; luding disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil it meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or ustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and porting through the ACOP. oints: A company has made a vague commitment to porting. I 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan, with ermediate goals, to physically source deforestation-free, at-free palm oil OR a company does not have ermediate goals, but commits to physically source | | - | |
| progressinclu that is sus repoTime bound goals to physically source palm oilFull 5 inter peat- inter defor3 poi inter plan CSPC WITH 100% | Iuding disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil it meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or ustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and borting through the ACOP. oints: A company has made a vague commitment to borting. I 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan, with ermediate goals, to physically source deforestation-free, at-free palm oil OR a company does not have ermediate goals, but commits to physically source | 10 | - | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oilFull 5 inter peat- inter defor3 poi inter peat- galm3 poi inter peat- plan CSPC WITH 100% | orting. I 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan, with ermediate goals, to physically source deforestation-free, at-free palm oil OR a company does not have ermediate goals, but commits to physically source | | - | |
| physically sourceinterpalm oilpeat-interdefor3 poiinterpeat-planCSPCWITH100% | ermediate goals, to physically source deforestation-free, at-free palm oil OR a company does not have ermediate goals, but commits to physically source | | | |
| inter peat plan CSPC WITH 100% | | 5 | - | |
| 1 noi | oints: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT ermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, at-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound n WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% PO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan THOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 0% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | - | |
| inter | oint: A company has a time-bound plan, with no ermediate goals, to physically source 100% CSPO or tainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | _ | |
| <i>verification</i> supp | I 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with opliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all nciples in its palm oil commitment. | | _ | |

DOMINO'S

| | | Possible | | | |
|------------------|---|----------|-------|---|-------------------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | | Notes |
| 6 | | 20 | | 0 | No data available |
| Current sourcing | Current coursing scores were determined by an averaged | | | | |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil | | | | |
| | derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: | | | | |
| | 1. deforestation- and peat-free; | | | | |
| | 2. CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | | | |
| | | | | | |
| | Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: | | | | |
| | Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. | | | | |
| | Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or | | | | |
| | GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted | | | | |
| | at 0.5. | | | | |
| | CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | | |
| Total | | 100 | | 0 | |

Reviewed Materials

1. Launch Business Article: <u>http://lunchbusiness.co.uk/bha-supports-uk-government-s-palm-oil-pledge</u>

DUNKIN' BRANDS

| | | Possible | | Notes |
|---|--|----------|-------|---|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | |
| Deforestation-Free | | 20 | 20 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to deforestation | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. | | + | "Dunkin' Brands supports and holds our suppliers accountabl to the following principles in our long-term commitment to source responsible palm oil. No DeforestationNo development of High Carbon Stock forests No development |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | High Conservation Value areas" ₁ |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 20 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to peatland destruction | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by committing to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | + | Dunkin' Brands supports and holds our suppliers accountable to the following principles in our long-term commitment to source responsible palm oilNo Development on Peat No development on peat areas regardless of depthBest Management Practices for existing plantations on Peat" ₁ |
| | 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion. | | - | |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Traceability | | 20 | 20 | |
| Commitment to tracing palm oil | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified. | 15 | + | "Dunkin' Brands requires our suppliers to adhere to the principles outlined below and create transparency and traceability along the palm oil supply chain to the plantation." ₁ |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability. | | - | |
| Commitment to ask their suppliers about the GHG footprint of their production | Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.6 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies. | 5 | + | "Dunkin' Brands supports and holds our suppliers accountable to the following principles in our long-term commitment to source responsible palm oilProgressively reduce Greenhouse Gas (GHG) Emissions on existing plantations from all sources" ₁ |

DUNKIN' BRANDS

| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Possible Points | Score | Notes |
|--|--|--------------------|-------|---|
| Transparency | | 20 | 10 | |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. | 10 | - | "Dunkin' Brands will release progress reports annually in addition to our Corporate Social Responsibility report, which is published every two years." ₁ |
| | 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. | | + | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan, with intermediate goals, to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | - | |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | _ | |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan, with no intermediate goals, to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | - | |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | | + | "Current and potential suppliers are required to complete a supplier code of conduct survey to help identify social and environmental risks in our supply chain and to ensure continued adherence to Dunkin' Brands' policies and standards. We are working with our suppliers to develop a plan to source 100% sustainable palm oil by 2016, and to ensure independent verification of compliance with our guidelines." ₁ |
| | | 5 | | |

DUNKIN' BRANDS

| | | Possible | | |
|------------------|--|----------|-------|-------------------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Current sourcing | | 20 | 0 | No data available |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit | | | |
| | oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | |
| Total | | 100 | 70 | |

References

1. Dunkin' Brands Guidelines for Sourcing Palm Oil: http://www.dunkinbrands.com/internal_redirect/cms.ipressroom.com.s3.amazonaws.com/226/files/20150/Palm%20Oil%20Policy%20for%20website.pdf

Other Reviewed Materials

- Dunkin' Commits to 100% Sustainable Palm Oil by 2016: <u>http://www.dunkindonuts.com/DDBlog/2014/09/dunkin_commits_to1.html#sthash.0EhPi4Bc.gAgFIE5i.dpbs</u>
- 3. Dunkin' Brands Announces Commitment to 100% Sustainable Palm Oil: <u>http://www.dunkinbrands.com/Press-Releases/DUNKIN-BRANDS-ANNOUNCES-</u> COMMITMENT-TO-100-SUSTAINABLE-PALM-OIL-4cc.aspx

MCDONALD'S

| | | Possible | | Notes |
|---|--|----------|-------|---|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | |
| Deforestation-Free | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to deforestation | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. | | - | |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to peatland destruction | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by committing to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| | 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion. | | - | |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Traceability | | 20 | 10 | |
| Commitment to tracing palm oil | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified. 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to | 15 | - | "In 2010, we undertook an in-depth review of our supply chain to establish the sources of palm oil used in selected markets for restaurant cooking oil and par-fry for chicken and potato products." ₁ |
| | traceability. | | + | |
| Commitment to ask their suppliers about the GHG footprint of their production | Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.6 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies. | 5 | - | |

MCDONALD'S

| | | Possible | | |
|--|--|-----------|-------|---|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Possible | Score | Notes |
| | | 20 | 10 | |
| Transparency | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its prograss: | -• | 10 | RSPO member and submitted 2013-2014 ACOP ₂ |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. | 10 | + | RSPO member and submitted 2013-2014 ACOP ₂ |
| | 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. | | - | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan, with intermediate goals, to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | - | |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | - | |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan, with no intermediate goals, to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | _ | |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | 5 | - | |

MCDONALD'S

| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Possible Points | Score | Notes |
|------------------|--|--------------------|-------|--|
| Current sourcing | | 20 | 4.4 | Numbers taken from ACOP |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (CPO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | $= 20 * \text{Mean} \begin{pmatrix} \frac{0 + .5 * 12060 + .25 * 23825}{98856} \\ \frac{0 + 0 + .5 * 774}{1218} \\ No POD \end{pmatrix}$ |
| Total | | 100 | 24.4 | |

References

1. Sustainable Sourcing at McDonald's: <u>http://www.aboutmcdonalds.com/content/dam/AboutMcDonalds/2.0/pdfs/McD_SixPriorityProducts.pdf</u>

2. 2013-3014 ACOP: http://www.rspo.org/file/acop2014/submissions/mcdonalds-corporation-ACOP2014.pdf

Other Reviewed Materials

- 3. Our Supply Chain: http://www.aboutmcdonalds.com/mcd/sustainability/sourcing/priority-products.html
- 4. McDonald's Corporate Social Responsibility and Sustainability Report 2012-2013

STARBUCKS

| | | Possible | | Notes |
|---|--|----------|-------|---|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | |
| Deforestation-Free | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to deforestation | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest | | - | "Further, we are committed to using 100% RSPO certified pair oil in our Starbucks-branded products in company owned stores globally by 2015"1 Not strong enough standards for points, must be in all stores not just company owned stores. |
| | protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to peatland destruction | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by committing to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | "Further, we are committed to using 100% RSPO certified palm oil in our Starbucks-branded products in company owned stores globally by 2015"1 Not strong enough standards for points, must be in all stores not just company owned stores. |
| | 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion. | | - | |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Traceability | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to tracing palm oil | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified. | 15 | - | |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability. | | - | |
| Commitment to ask their suppliers about the GHG footprint of | Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.6 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies. | | - | |
| their production | | 5 | | |

STARBUCKS

| | | Possible | | |
|--|--|----------|-------|-------------------------------------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Transparency | | 20 | 10 | |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. | 10 | + | RSPO member as of 2014 ₂ |
| | 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. | | - | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan, with intermediate goals, to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | - | |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | - | |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan, with no intermediate goals, to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | - | |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | 5 | - | |

STARBUCKS

| | | Possible | | |
|------------------|--|----------|-------|-------------------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Current sourcing | | 20 | 0 | No data available |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | |
| Total | | 100 | 10 | |

References

1. Starbucks and Sustainable Palm Oil: <u>http://globalassets.starbucks.com/assets/85d80f17fae84fc9bb4697e9edc38b74.pdf</u>

2. Starbucks RSPO member page: <u>http://www.rspo.org/members/2301/Starbucks-Coffee-Company</u>

Other Reviewed Materials

3. Starbucks Supplier Social Responsibility Standards: Manufactured Goods and Services: http://globalassets.starbucks.com/assets/1deb372ee3d840179e59c5b9c21cd5fe.pdf

SUBWAY

| | | Possible | | Notes |
|---|---|----------|-------|---|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | |
| Deforestation-Free | | 20 | 20 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to deforestation | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. | | + | "Our Commitment: To encourage practices that support sustainable palm oil including the growing, processing and transportation processes that will stop deforestation while continuing to support the communities which rely on its |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | production including the palm oil used in our products will: Not come from areas cleared of natural forest after November 2005 Protect high conservation areas Protect peat land and forest areas of "high carbon" valueComply with RSPO principles and criteria" ₁ |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 15 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to peatland destruction | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by committing to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland | | - | "Our Commitment: To encourage practices that support sustainable palm oil including the growing, processing and transportation processes that will stop deforestation while continuing to support the communities which rely on its production including the palm oil used in our products will Protect peat land and forest areas of "high carbon" valueComply with RSPO principles and criteria" ₁ |
| | protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion. | | + | |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Traceability | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to tracing palm oil | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified. | 15 | - | |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability. | | - | |
| Commitment to ask their suppliers about the GHG footprint of | Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.6 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies. | | - | |

SUBWAY

| | | Possible | | |
|--|--|----------|-------|---|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Transparency | | 20 | 3 | |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to | 10 | - | |
| | reporting. | | - | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan, with intermediate goals, to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | _ | "Our Commitment To continue to work with our suppliers to improve the sustainability of the palm oil used in our products with a goal is that all approved SUBWAY [®] products that use palm oil as an ingredient will use certified sustainable palm oil by 2017 As of April 2013 the supplier of our cookies began purchasing GreenPalm certificates to offset the volume used in our |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | + | cookies. The palm oil used in products sold in the European Union will be certified sustainable by 2015." ₁ |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan, with no intermediate goals, to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | _ | |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | 5 | _ | |

SUBWAY

| | | Possible | | |
|------------------|--|----------|-------|-------------------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Current sourcing | | 20 | 0 | No data available |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | |
| Total | | 100 | 38 | |

References

1. Sustainable Sourcing: <u>http://www.subway.com/subwayroot/about_us/Social_Responsibility/SustainableSourcing.aspx</u>

Other Reviewed Materials

2. Vendor Employment Practices Code of Conduct: <u>http://www.subway.com/subwayroot/about_us/Social_Responsibility/DAICCEP.pdf</u>

WENDY'S

| | | Dessible | | Notes |
|------------------------|---|--------------|---------|-------|
| Critoria | Searing Guidance | Possible | Score | |
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points 20 | Score 0 | |
| Deforestation-Free | | 20 | U | |
| Commitment to | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all | | | |
| source palm oil that | forests and include language referring to secondary, | | | |
| does not contribute to | disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. | | - | |
| deforestation | | | | |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest | | | |
| | protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary | | | |
| | forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or | | | |
| | sustainable palm oil. | | | |
| | | | - | |
| | | | | |
| | | | | |
| | | | | |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm | | | |
| source palm oil that | oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and | | | |
| does not contribute to | if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that | | | |
| peatland destruction | those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that | | _ | |
| peutiana destraction | are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs | | | |
| | requirement can be fulfilled by committing to physically | | | |
| | sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | | |
| | 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland | | | |
| | protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new | | | |
| | conversion. | | - | |
| | | | | |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO | | | |
| | or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Traceability | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil | | | |
| tracing palm oil | to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to | | | |
| | the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose | | - | |
| | tracing can be verified. | 15 | | |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to | | | |
| | traceability. | | - | |
| Commitment to ask | Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.6 on the | | | |
| their suppliers about | 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other | | _ | |
| | | | - | |
| the GHG footprint of | policies. | | | |

WENDY'S

| | | Possible | | |
|--|--|----------|-------|-------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Transparency | | 20 | 0 | |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. | 10 | - | |
| | 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. | | - | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan, with intermediate goals, to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | - | |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | _ | |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan, with no intermediate goals, to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | - | |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | 5 | _ | |

WENDY'S

| | | Possible | | |
|-----------------------------|--|----------|-------|-------------------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Current sourcing | | 20 | 0 | No data available |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | |
| Total Reviewed Materials | | 100 | 0 |) |

Reviewed Materials

1. Supply Chain Practices: <u>https://www.wendys.com/en-us/about-wendys/supply-chain-practices</u>

YUM! BRANDS

| | | Possible | | Notes |
|--|--|----------|-------|-------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | |
| | | 20 | 0 | |
| Deforestation-Free Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to deforestation | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. | | - | |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | 20 | - | |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 0 | |
| <i>Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to peatland destruction</i> | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by committing to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| | 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion. | | - | |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Traceability | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to tracing palm oil | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified. | 15 | - | |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability. | | - | |
| Commitment to ask their suppliers about the GHG footprint of their production | Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.6 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies. | 5 | - | |

YUM! BRANDS

| | | Dessible | | |
|--|--|--------------------|-------|-------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Possible Points | Score | Notes |
| | | 20 | 3C01e | |
| Transparency | | 20 | U | |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. | 10 | - | |
| | 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. | | - | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan, with intermediate goals, to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | _ | |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | _ | |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan, with no intermediate goals, to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | _ | |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | 5 | - | |

YUM! BRANDS

| | | Possible | | |
|------------------|--|----------|-------|-------------------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Current sourcing | | 20 | 0 | No data available |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | |
| Total | | 100 | 0 |) |

Reviewed Materials

Nutritional Improvement: <u>http://yumcsr.com/food/nutritional-improvement.asp</u>
 Supplier Scorecard: <u>http://yumcsr.com/environment/supplier-scorecard.asp</u>

Store Brand

COSTCO

| | | Possible | | Notes |
|---|--|----------|-------|-------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | |
| Deforestation-Free | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to deforestation | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. | | _ | |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to peatland destruction | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| | 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion. | | - | |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Traceability | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to tracing palm oil | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified. | 15 | _ | |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability. | | - | |
| Commitment to ask their suppliers about the GHG footprint of their production | Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.6 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies. | 5 | - | |

COSTCO

| | | Possible | | |
|--|--|----------|-------|-------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Transparency | | 20 | 0 | |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. | 10 | - | |
| | 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. | | - | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan, with intermediate goals, to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | - | |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | _ | |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan, with no intermediate goals, to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | - | |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | 5 | _ | |

COSTCO

| | | Possible | | |
|------------------|---|----------|-------|-------------------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Current sourcing | | 20 | 0 | No data available |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full | | | |
| | Deforestation- and peat-free pain on was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | |
| Total | | 100 | 0 | |

Reviewed Materials

1. 2009 Corporate Sustainability Report: <u>http://phx.corporate-ir.net/External.File?item=UGFyZW50SUQ9MTU2NDF8Q2hpbGRJRD0tMXxUeXBIPTM=&t=1</u>

| | | Possible | | Notes |
|---|--|----------|-------|-------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | |
| Deforestation-Free | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to deforestation | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. | | _ | |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to peatland destruction | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| | 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion. | | - | |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Traceability | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to tracing palm oil | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified. | 15 | - | |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability. | | - | |
| Commitment to ask their suppliers about the GHG footprint of their production | Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.6 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies. | 5 | - | |

| | | Dessible | | |
|--|--|--------------|-------|-------|
| Critoria | Seering Cuidence | Possible | Coore | Netza |
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points 20 | Score | Notes |
| Transparency | | 20 | 0 | |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. | 10 | - | |
| | 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. | | - | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan, with intermediate goals, to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | - | |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | - | |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan, with no intermediate goals, to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | - | |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | 5 | - | |

| | | Possible | | |
|----------------------------|--|----------|-------|-------------------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Current sourcing | | 20 | 0 | No data available |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | |
| Total Reviewed Material | | 100 | 0 | |

Reviewed Materials

1. 2013 Corporate Social Responsibility Report: <u>http://www.cvshealth.com/sites/default/files/2013_CVSCaremark_CSR_Report%20Secured.pdf</u>

DOLLAR GENERAL

| | | Dessible | | Notes |
|-------------------------------|--|--------------|-------|-------|
| Critorio | Cooring Cuidance | Possible | Cooro | Notes |
| | Scoring Guidance | Points 20 | Score | |
| Deforestation-Free | | 20 | 0 | |
| | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all | | | |
| | forests and include language referring to secondary, | | | |
| | disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. | | - | |
| deforestation | | | | |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest | | | |
| | protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary | | | |
| | forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or | | | |
| | sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| | | | | |
| | | | | |
| | | | | |
| | | | | |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm | | | |
| source palm oil that | oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and | | | |
| does not contribute to | if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that | | | |
| peatland destruction | those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that | | - | |
| | are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs | | | |
| | requirement can be fulfilled by physically sourcing 100% | | | |
| | CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | | |
| | 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland | | | |
| | protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new | | _ | |
| | conversion. | | - | |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO | | | |
| | or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| - 1.00 | | 20 | 0 | |
| Traceability Commitment to | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil | | Ū | |
| | to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to | | | |
| . | the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose | | _ | |
| | tracing can be verified. | 15 | - | |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to | | | |
| | traceability. | | - | |
| Commitment to ask | Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.6 on the | | | |
| | | | | |
| their suppliers about | 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other | | _ | |
| | 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies. | | - | |

DOLLAR GENERAL

| | | D | | |
|--|--|--------------|-------|-------|
| Critorio | Securing Childrene | Possible | Coore | Notes |
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points 20 | Score | Notes |
| Transparency | | 20 | 0 | |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. | 10 | - | |
| | 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. | | - | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan, with intermediate goals, to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | - | |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | _ | |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan, with no intermediate goals, to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | _ | |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | | - | |

DOLLAR GENERAL

| | | Possible | | |
|------------------|--|----------|-------|-------------------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Current sourcing | | 20 | 0 | No data available |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | |
| Total | | 100 | 0 | |

Reviewed Materials

1. Code of Ethics: <u>http://files.shareholder.com/downloads/DOLLAR/0x0x650091/e0cd2bb9-4a8f-4995-aa1e-</u> ac46958e5373/DG 2013 Code of Ethics Final .pdf

2. Direct Import Vendor – Quick Start Overview: <u>https://www.dgpartners.com/Vendors/imports/Direct%20Import%20Vendor%20-%20Quick%20Start%20Overview.pdf</u>

DOLLAR TREE

| | | Possible | | Notes |
|-------------------------|--|-----------|-------|-------|
| Criteria S | Scoring Guidance | Possible | Score | |
| | | 20 | 0 | |
| Deforestation-Free | | 20 | U | |
| | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all Forests and include language referring to secondary, | | | |
| - | disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. | | | |
| deforestation | | | - | |
| - | | | | |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest | | | |
| | protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary | | | |
| | forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | | |
| 51 | sustainable paint on. | | - | |
| | | | | |
| | | | | |
| | | | | |
| | | | | |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 0 | |
| | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm | | | |
| - | bil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and | | | |
| | f sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that | | | |
| | hose plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that | | - | |
| | are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs | | | |
| | requirement can be fulfilled by physically sourcing 100% | | | |
| | CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | | |
| | 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland | | | |
| | protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new | | - | |
| C | conversion. | | | |
| 5 | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO | | | |
| 0 | or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Traceability | | 20 | 0 | |
| | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil | | | |
| | to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to | | | |
| | the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose | | _ | |
| | racing can be verified. | 15 | | |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to | | | |
| tr | raceability. | | - | |
| Commitment to ask F | | | | |
| | -ull 5 points: A company answers "yes" to guestion 2.6 on the 1 | | | |
| | Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.6 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in | | | |
| their suppliers about 2 | | | - | |

DOLLAR TREE

| | | Dessibl | | Ţ |
|--|--|--------------------|-------|---|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Possible Points | Score | |
| Transparency | | 20 | 0 | D |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. | 10 | - | |
| | 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. | | - | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan, with intermediate goals, to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | _ | |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | - | |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan, with no intermediate goals, to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | _ | _ |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | 5 | - | |

DOLLAR TREE

| | | Possible | | |
|------------------|---|----------|-------|-------------------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Current sourcing | | 20 | 0 | No data available |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: | | | |
| | Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | |
| Total | | 100 | 0 | |

No relevant materials found

KROGER

| | | Possible | | Notes |
|---|--|----------|-------|--|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | |
| Deforestation-Free | | 20 | 10 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to deforestation | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. | | - | "In April of 2013, Kroger adopted a Company policy about the use of palm oil in our corporate brand products. We committed to purchase 100% certified sustainable palm oil to be used in these products by the end of 2015." $_1$ |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | + | |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 5 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to peatland destruction | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | "In April of 2013, Kroger adopted a Company policy about the use of palm oil in our corporate brand products. We committed to purchase 100% certified sustainable palm oil to be used in these products by the end of 2015." ₁ |
| | 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion. | | - | |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | + | |
| Traceability | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to tracing palm oil | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified. | 15 | - | |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability. | | - | |
| Commitment to ask their suppliers about the GHG footprint of | Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.6 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies. | | - | |
| the GHG footprint of their production | policies. | 5 | | |

KROGER

| | | Possible | | |
|--|--|-----------|-------|--|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points 20 | Score | Notes |
| Transparency | | 20 | 8 | |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. | 10 | - | <i>"Kroger will disclose its progress toward this goal in its annual sustainability report"</i> ² |
| | 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. | | + | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan, with intermediate goals, to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | - | "In April of 2013, Kroger adopted a Company policy about the use of palm oil in our corporate brand products. We committed to purchase 100% certified sustainable palm oil to be used in these products by the end of 2015 Since we've made the commitment, |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | + | our corporate brands, manufacturing sourcing and sustainability teams have developed an implementation plan to transition to Certified Sustainable Palm Oil by the end of 2014, in three plants that produce Kroger manufactured products containing palm oil." ₁ |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan, with no intermediate goals, to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | _ | |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | | _ | "Kroger recognizes the benefits of using responsibly-sourced palm oil in all of our Corporate Brand products. We also recognize this is a developing issue for many of our suppliers, and we are committed to working with them to improve sustainability in the palm oil production supply chain." ₂ – not strong enough |

KROGER

| | | Possible | | |
|------------------|--|----------|-------|-------------------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Current sourcing | | 20 | C | No data available |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | |
| Total | | 100 | 23 | 3 |

References

2014 Sustainability Report: <u>http://sustainability.kroger.com/1-Kroger_30043_CSR14.pdf</u>
 Palm Oil Policy Statement: <u>http://www.thekrogerco.com/docs/statements-policies/palm-oil-policy-statement.pdf?sfvrsn=0</u>

SAFEWAY

| | | Possible | _ | Notes |
|---|--|----------|-------|--|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | |
| Deforestation-Free | | 20 | 20 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to deforestation | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. | | + | "Safeway is committed to ensuring that the palm oil products it uses come from verified responsible sourcesIn addition to meeting the RSPO Principles and Criteria above, Safeway defines palm oil products responsibly produced if they criticized from companies where plantations and former pact |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | originate from companies whose plantations and farms meet the following criteria No deforestation has occurred after December 20th, 2013, including protection of High Conservation Value (HCV) and High Carbon Stock (HCS) forests" ₁ |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 20 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to peatland destruction | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | + | "Consistent with Safeway's values as a company, we expect suppliers to provide palm oil and palm derivatives for our products that are verified to be free of deforestation, free of expansion on carbon–rich peat lands" ₁ "Verified to be in compliance with the Principles and Criteria of the RSPO, which include, but are not limited to: |
| | 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion. | | - | a) The use of appropriate best practices by growers and millers and environmental responsibility and conservation of natural resources and biodiversity" ₁ |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Traceability | | 20 | 15 | |
| Commitment to tracing palm oil | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified. | 15 | + | "Safeway is committed to ensuring that the palm oil products uses come from verified responsible sources supported by del through fully traceable supply chains, including the production Fresh Fruit Bunches (FFB)." ₁ |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability. | | - | |
| Commitment to ask their suppliers about the GHG footprint of their production | Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.6 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies. | 5 | - | |

SAFEWAY

| | | Possible | | |
|--|--|----------|-------|--|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Transparency | | 20 | 15 | |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. | 10 | + | Joined the RSPO in 2014 ₂ |
| | 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. | | - | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan with intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | - | |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | - | |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | - | |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | 5 | + | "Suppliers are expected to: 1. Provide Safeway with responsibly produced palm oil and palm oil derivatives that meet our criteria listed above. 2. Collaborate with Safeway on how to meet these criteria by: a. Responding to requests for information regarding palm oil sourcing b. Engaging in efforts to establish responsible palm oil sources c. Screening for and eliminating palm oil and palm derivatives sourced from companies and/or plantations associated with on-going deforestation, development or expansion on peatland of any depth, illegally held lands, land grabbing, social conflicts and/or human and labor right violations as of December 20th, 2013" ₁ |

SAFEWAY

| | | Possible | | |
|------------------|--|----------|-------|--|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Current sourcing | | 20 | 2.1 | |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | $= 20 * Mean \begin{pmatrix} \frac{0+.5*20.5+0}{100} \\ No PKO \\ \frac{0+.5*20.5+0}{100} \end{pmatrix}$ • Numbers taken from Supplier Sustainability Guidelines and Expectations p.32. Assumed half palm fruit oil and half palm oil derivatives. |
| Total | | 100 | 72.1 | |

References

1. Supplier Sustainability Guidelines and Expectations: <u>http://suppliers.safeway.com/usa/pdf/supplier_sustainability_expectations.pdf</u>

2. RSPO: http://www.rspo.org/members/2494/Safeway-Inc

*Note: Safeway is merging with Albertson's and this score was analyzed based on Safeway's current palm oil policies and sourcing only.

TARGET

| | | Possible | | Notes |
|---|--|----------|-------|-------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | |
| Deforestation-Free | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to deforestation | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. | | _ | |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to peatland destruction | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| | 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion. | | - | |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Traceability | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to tracing palm oil | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified. | 15 | _ | |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability. | | - | |
| Commitment to ask their suppliers about the GHG footprint of their production | Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.6 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies. | 5 | - | |

TARGET

| | | Possible | | |
|--|--|----------|-------|-------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Transparency | | 20 | 0 | |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. | 10 | - | |
| | 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. | | - | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan, with intermediate goals, to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | - | |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | _ | |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan, with no intermediate goals, to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | _ | |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | 5 | _ | |

TARGET

| | | Possible | | |
|------------------|--|----------|-------|-------------------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Current sourcing | | 20 | 0 | No data available |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | |
| Total | | 100 | 0 | |

Reviewed Materials

1. 2013 Corporate Responsibility Report: <u>https://corporate.target.com/_media/TargetCorp/csr/pdf/2013-corporate-responsibility-report.pdf</u>

2. Target Sustainable Product Standard: <u>https://corporate.target.com/_media/TargetCorp/csr/pdf/Target-Sustainable-Product-Standard-7-15-14.pdf</u>

3. Sustainable Products: <u>https://corporate.target.com/corporate-responsibility/environment/sustainable-products</u>

WALGREEN CO.

| | | Possible | | Notes |
|--|--|-----------|-------|-------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | |
| | | 20 | 0 | |
| Deforestation-Free Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to deforestation | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. | | | |
| - | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to peatland destruction | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| | 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion. | | - | |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Traceability | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to tracing palm oil | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified. | 15 | - | |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability. | | - | |
| Commitment to ask their suppliers about the GHG footprint of their production | Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.6 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies. | 5 | - | |

WALGREEN CO.

| | | Possible | | |
|--|--|----------|-------|-------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Transparency | | 20 | 0 | |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and | | - | |
| | reporting through the ACOP. | 10 | | |
| | 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. | | - | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan, with intermediate goals, to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | - | |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | - | |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan, with no intermediate goals, to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | - | |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | | _ | |
| | | 5 | | |

WALGREEN CO.

| | | Possible | | |
|----------------------------|--|----------|-------|-------------------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Current sourcing | | 20 | 0 | No data available |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | |
| Total Reviewed Material | | 100 | 0 | |

Reviewed Materials

1. Ethics Policy Statement: <u>http://www.slideshare.net/finance4/ethics-policy-statement-walgreen</u>

WALMART

| Scoring Guidance Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary | Points 20 | Score 10 - | "Date expected to be using 100% RSPO certified oil palm from physical supply chains (Identity Preserved, Segregated and/or |
|--|---|--|--|
| forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest | 20 | 10 - | "Date expected to be using 100% RSPO certified oil palm from |
| forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest | | - | |
| | | | Mass Balance) - own brand products: $2020''_1$ |
| forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | + | |
| | 20 | 5 | |
| Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | "3.3 Date expected to be using 100% RSPO certified oil palm from physical supply chains (Identity Preserved, Segregated and/or Mass Balance) - own brand products: 2020" ₁ |
| 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion. | | - | |
| 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | + | |
| | 20 | 0 | |
| Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified. | 15 | - | |
| 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability. | | - | |
| Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.6 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies. | _ | - | |
| | oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion. 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified. 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability. Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.6 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil.15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion.5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil.20Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified.15 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability.Full 5 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level or that the supplier whose tracing can be verified.1510 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability.Full 5 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability. | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil.+ 200 Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified.1510 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability.15Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to traceabilityFull 5 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceabilityFull 5 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceabilityFull 5 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceabilityFull 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.6 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies |

WALMART

| | | Possible | | |
|--|--|----------|-------|---|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Transparency | | 20 | 13 | |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. | 10 | + | RSPO member and submitted ACOP ₁ |
| | 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. | | - | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan with intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | - | "3.1 Date expected to start (or year started) using RSPO-certified palm oil products - own brand: 2011 3.2 Date expected to be (or already) using 100% RSPO certified palm oil products from any supply chain option - own brand: 201 3.3 Date expected to be using 100% RSPO certified oil palm from |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | + | physical supply chains (Identity Preserved, Segregated and/or Mass Balance) - own brand products: 2020" ₁ |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | _ | |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company lays out the process by which it will verify that it and its suppliers are meeting their palm oil commitments. | 5 | - | |

WALMART

| | | Possible | | |
|------------------|--|----------|-------|---|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Current sourcing | | 20 | .8 | Numbers taken from ACOP |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | $= 20 * \text{Mean} \begin{pmatrix} \frac{0+.5*(4345.40+4932.29)+.25*14364.50}{65033} \\ \frac{0+.5*0+.5*0}{Walmart \ does \ not \ measure \ total} \\ \frac{0+.5*0+.5*0}{Walmart \ does \ not \ measure \ total} \end{pmatrix}$ *Confirmed Walmart uses PKO and POD although not listed on ACOP. |
| Total | | 100 | 28.8 | |

References

1. 2013-2014 ACOP: http://www.rspo.org/file/acop2014/submissions/wal-mart-stores-inc-ACOP2014.pdf

Other Reviewed Materials

- 2. 2014 Global Responsibility Report: <u>http://cdn.corporate.walmart.com/db/e1/b551a9db42fd99ea24141f76065f/2014-global-responsibility-report.pdf</u>
- 3. Audit Process: <u>http://corporate.walmart.com/global-responsibility/ethical-sourcing/audit-process</u>

WHOLE FOODS

| | | Possible | | Notes |
|---|--|----------|-------|--|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | |
| Deforestation-Free | | 20 | 10 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to deforestation | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to protecting all forests and include language referring to secondary, disturbed, or high carbon stock forests. 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to forest | | - | "Whole Foods Market pledges to support the development of more sources of sustainable, fairly traded palm oil, to ensure that palm oil in our private label (365 Everyday Value™ and Whole Foods Market™) brand products are not sourced from the conversion of rainforest ecosystems or from companies engaged in the conversion of natural forests and/or peat lands; respect the free, prior and informed consent of interested communities and meet or exceed RSPO (Roundtable on Sustainable Palm Oil) principles and criteria." ₁ |
| | protection OR commits to protection of HCV or primary forests OR commits to physically sourcing 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | + | |
| Peat-Free | | 20 | 20 | |
| Commitment to source palm oil that does not contribute to peatland destruction | Full 20 points: A company needs to commit to purchase palm oil that does not come from new conversion of peatlands and if sourcing from existing plantations on peat, ensure that those plantations use best management practices (BMPs) that are at least as strong as those of the RSPO. The BMPs requirement can be fulfilled by committing to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | + | "Whole Foods Market pledges to support the development of more sources of sustainable, fairly traded palm oil, to ensure that palm oil in our private label (365 Everyday Value™ and Whole Foods Market™) brand products are not sourced from the conversion of rainforest ecosystems or from companies engaged in the conversion of natural forests and/or peat lands; respect the free, prior and informed consent of interested communities and meet or exceed RSPO (Roundtabl on Sustainable Palm Oil) principles and criteria." ₁ |
| | 15 points: A company has a vague commitment to peatland protection OR it only commits to not sourcing from new conversion. | | - | |
| | 5 points: A company commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil. | | - | |
| Traceability | | 20 | 0 | |
| Commitment to tracing palm oil | Full 15 points: A company must commit to trace its palm oil to the plantation level or that the supply chain is traced to the plantation level in conjunction with a supplier whose tracing can be verified. | 15 | - | |
| | 10 points: A company has a vague commitment to traceability. | | - | |
| Commitment to ask their suppliers about the GHG footprint of | Full 5 points: A company answers "yes" to question 2.6 on the 2013-2014 RSPO ACOP OR this information is included in other policies. | | _ | |

WHOLE FOODS

| | | Possible | | |
|--|--|----------|-------|---|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Transparency | | 20 | 0 | |
| Annual reporting of progress | Full 10 points: A company must be reporting its progress; including disclosure of the percentage (or volume) of palm oil that meets deforestation-free, peat-free criteria, is CSPO, or is sustainable. This can be satisfied by joining the RSPO and reporting through the ACOP. | 10 | - | |
| | 5 points: A company has made a vague commitment to reporting. | | - | |
| Time bound goals to physically source palm oil | Full 5 points: A company has a time-bound plan with intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil OR a company does not have intermediate goals, but commits to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by 2015. | 5 | _ | "Whole Foods Market pledges to support the development of more sources of sustainable, fairly traded palm oil, to ensure that palm oil in our private label (365 Everyday Value™ and Whole Foods Market™) brand products are not sourced from the conversion of rainforest ecosystems or from companies engaged |
| | 3 points: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source deforestation-free, peat-free palm oil by a date after 2015 OR has a time-bound plan WITH intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil OR has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals if commits to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by 2015. | | - | in the conversion of natural forests and/or peat lands; respect the free, prior and informed consent of interested communities and meet or exceed RSPO (Roundtable on Sustainable Palm Oil) principles and criteriaWhole Foods Market pledges that it will only use sources of palm oil independently verified and certified to these criteria in our private label brand products by 2012." ₁ - outdated policy, no indication that this has been met |
| | 1 point: A company has a time-bound plan WITHOUT intermediate goals to physically source 100% CSPO or sustainable palm oil by a date after 2015. | | _ | |
| Layout a process of verification | Full 5 points: A company outlines how it will work with suppliers to ensure it and its suppliers are meeting all principles in its palm oil commitment. | | - | "Whole Foods Market pledges that it will only use sources of palm oil independently verified and certified to these criteria in our private label brand products by 2012."1–outdated policy, no indication that this has been met |

WHOLE FOODS

| | | Possible | | |
|---------------------|--|----------|-------|-------------------|
| Criteria | Scoring Guidance | Points | Score | Notes |
| Current sourcing | | 20 | 0 | No data available |
| | Current sourcing scores were determined by an averaged percentage of palm fruit oil, palm kernel oil, and palm oil derivatives a company is currently buying which is either: deforestation- and peat-free; CSPO or sustainable palm oil. Different forms of palm oil were given different weight: Deforestation- and peat-free palm oil was given full weight. Physically sourced CSPO or sustainable palm fruit oil, CSPO or sustainable palm kernel oil (physical or GreenPalm), and CSPO or sustainable palm derivatives (physical or GreenPalm) were weighted at 0.5. CSPO palm fruit oil sourced through GreenPalm (PFO_{GP}) was given a weighting of 0.25. | | | |
| Total References | | 100 | 30 | |

References

1. Green Mission: <u>http://www.wholefoodsmarket.com/mission-values/environmental-stewardship/green-mission</u>